UNITED NATIONS

A E

General Assembly
Economic and Social Council

Distr.
GENERAL

A/S-19/14
E/1997/60
27 May 1997

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

GENERAL ASSEMBLY
Nineteenth special session
Item 5 of the provisional agenda*

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL
Geneva, 30 June-25 July 1997
Items 7 (a) and (b) of the provisional agenda**
REPORTS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF SUBSIDIARY BODIES: ECONOMIC QUESTIONS; ENVIRONMENTAL QUESTIONS

REPORT OF THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT ON PREPARATIONS FOR THE SPECIAL SESSION OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY FOR THE PURPOSE OF AN OVERALL REVIEW AND APPRAISAL OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF AGENDA 21***

---

* A/S-19/1.

** E/1997/100.

*** Attention is also drawn to the report of the Commission on its fifth session (E/1997/29).

CONTENTS

Chapter Page

I. MATTERS CALLING FOR ACTION BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY 3

A. Proposed draft political statement*

B. Proposed outcome of the special session 3

II. PREPARATIONS FOR THE SPECIAL SESSION OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY FOR THE PURPOSE OF AN OVERALL REVIEW AND APPRAISAL OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF AGENDA 21 57

Annexes

I. Chairman's summary of the high-level segment of the fifth session of the Commission on Sustainable Development 59

II. Summary reports of the working group of the Commission 69

---

* To be issued subsequently as a separate document.

Chapter I

MATTERS CALLING FOR ACTION BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY

A. Proposed draft political statement*

B. Proposed outcome of the special session

1. The Commission on Sustainable Development decides to transmit the following document on the proposed outcome of the special session to the General Assembly for consideration and adoption:

B. Assessment of progress made since the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development

1. **(Agreed)** The five years that have elapsed since the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) have been characterized by the accelerated globalization of interactions among countries in the areas of world trade, foreign direct investment and capital markets. Globalization presents new opportunities and challenges. It is important that national and international environmental and social policies be implemented and strengthened in order to ensure that globalization trends have a positive impact on sustainable development, especially in developing countries. The impact of recent trends in globalization on developing countries has been uneven. A limited number of developing countries have been able to take advantage of those trends, attracting large inflows of external private capital and experiencing significant export-led growth and acceleration of growth in per capita gross domestic product (GDP). Many other countries, however, in particular African countries and the least developed countries, have shown slow or negative growth and continue to be marginalized. As a result, they generally experienced stagnating or falling per capita GDP through 1995. In these and in some other developing countries, the problems of poverty, low levels of social development, inadequate infrastructure and lack of capital have prevented them from benefiting from globalization. While continuing their efforts to achieve sustainable development and to attract new investments, these countries still require international assistance in their efforts towards sustainable development. In particular the least developed countries continue to be heavily dependent on a declining volume of official development assistance (ODA) for the capacity-building and infrastructure development required to provide for basic needs and more effective participation in the globalizing world economy. In an increasingly interdependent world economy, the responsible conduct of monetary and other macroeconomic policies requires that their potential impact on other countries be taken into account. Since UNCED, the countries with economies in transition have achieved significant progress in implementing the principles of

---

* To be issued subsequently as a separate document.

sustainable development. However, the need for full integration of these countries into the world economy remains one of the crucial problems on their way towards sustainable development. The international community should continue to support these countries in their efforts to accelerate the transition to a market economy and to achieve sustainable development.

2. **(Agreed)** Although economic growth - reinforced by globalization - has allowed some countries to reduce the proportion of people in poverty, marginalization has increased for others. Too many countries have seen economic conditions worsen and public services deteriorate; the total number of people in the world living in poverty has increased. Income inequality has increased among countries and also within them, unemployment has worsened in many countries, and the gap between the least developed countries and other countries has grown rapidly in recent years. On a more positive note, population growth rates have been declining globally, largely as a result of expanded basic education and health care. That trend is projected to lead to a stable world population in the middle of the twenty-first century. There has also been progress in social services, with expanding access to education, declining infant mortality and increasing life expectancy in most countries. However, many people, particularly in the least developed countries, still do not have access to adequate food and basic social services or to clean water and sanitation. Reducing current inequities in the distribution of wealth and access to resources, both within and among countries, is one of the most serious challenges facing humankind.

3. **(Agreed)** Five years after UNCED, the state of the global environment has continued to deteriorate, as noted in the Global Environment Outlook of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP),[1] and significant environmental problems remain deeply embedded in the socio-economic fabric of countries in all regions. Some progress has been made in terms of institutional development, international consensus-building, public participation and private sector actions and, as a result, a number of countries have succeeded in curbing pollution and slowing the rate of resource degradation. Overall, however, trends are worsening. Many polluting emissions, notably of toxic substances, greenhouse gases and waste volumes are continuing to increase although in some industrialized countries emissions are decreasing. Marginal progress has been made in addressing unsustainable production and consumption patterns. Insufficient progress has also been identified in the field of environmentally sound management and adequate control of adequate transboundary movements of hazardous and radioactive wastes. Many countries undergoing rapid economic growth and urbanization are also experiencing increasing levels of air and water pollution, with accumulating impacts on human health. Acid rain and transboundary air pollution, once considered a problem only in the industrialized countries, are increasingly becoming a problem in many developing regions. In many poorer regions of the world, persistent poverty is contributing to accelerated degradation of natural resources and desertification has spread. In countries seriously affected by drought and or desertification, especially those in Africa, their agricultural productivity, among other things, is uncertain and continues to decline, thereby hampering their efforts to achieve sustainable development. Inadequate and unsafe water supplies are affecting an increasing number of people worldwide, aggravating problems of ill health and food insecurity among the poor. Conditions in natural habitats and

/...

fragile ecosystems, including mountain ecosystems, are still deteriorating in all regions of the world, resulting in diminishing biological diversity. At the global level, renewable resources, in particular freshwater, forests, topsoil and marine fish stocks, continue to be used at rates beyond their viable rates of regeneration; without improved management, this situation is clearly unsustainable.

4. **(Agreed)** While there has been progress in material and energy efficiency, particularly with reference to non-renewable resources, overall trends remain unsustainable. As a result, increasing levels of pollution threaten to exceed the capacity of the global environment to absorb them, increasing the potential obstacles to economic and social development in developing countries.

5. **(Agreed)** Since UNCED, extensive efforts have been made by Governments and international organizations to integrate environmental, economic and social objectives into decision-making by elaborating new policies and strategies for sustainable development or by adapting existing policies and plans. As many as 150 countries have responded to the commitments established at UNCED through national-level commissions or coordinating mechanisms designed to develop an integrated approach to sustainable development.

6. **(Agreed)** The major groups have demonstrated what can be achieved by taking committed action, sharing resources and building consensus, reflecting grass-roots concern and involvement. The efforts of local authorities are making Agenda 21 and the pursuit of sustainable development a reality at the local level through the implementation of "Local Agenda 21s" and other sustainable development programmes. Non-governmental organizations, educational institutions, the scientific community and the media have increased public awareness and discussion of the relations between environment and development in all countries. The involvement, role and responsibilities of business and industry, including transnational corporations, are important. Hundreds of small and large businesses have made "green business" a new operating mode. Workers and trade unions have established partnerships with employers and communities to encourage sustainable development in the workplace. Indigenous people have played an increasing role in addressing issues affecting their interests and particularly concerning their traditional knowledge and practices. Young people and women around the world have played a prominent role in galvanizing communities to recognize their responsibilities to future generations. Nevertheless, more opportunities should be created for women to participate effectively in economic, social and political development as equal partners in all sectors of the economy.

7. **(Agreed)** Among the achievements since UNCED are the entry into force of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (A/AC.237/18 (Part II)/Add.1 and Corr.1, annex I), the Convention on Biological Diversity[2] and the United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification in Those Countries Experiencing Serious Drought and/or Desertification, Particularly in Africa (A/49/84/Add.2, annex, appendix II); the conclusion of an agreement on straddling and migratory fish stocks (A/50/550, annex I); the adoption of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States;[3] and the elaboration of the Global Programme of Action for the Protection of the Marine Environment from Land-based Activities (A/51/116,

/...

annex II) and the entry into force of the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS).[4] Implementation of these important commitments and of others adopted before UNCED by all the parties to them, however, remains to be carried out, and in many cases further strengthening of their provisions is required as well as the mechanisms for putting them into effect. The establishment, restructuring, funding and replenishment of the Global Environment Facility (GEF) were a major achievement. However, its levels of funding and replenishment have not been sufficient fully to meet its objectives.

8. **(Agreed)** Progress has been made in incorporating the principles contained in the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development[5] - including the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities, which embodies the important concept of and basis for international partnership; the precautionary principle; the polluter pays principle; and the environmental impact assessment principle - in a variety of international and national legal instruments. While some progress has been made in implementing UNCED commitments through a variety of international legal instruments, much remains to be done to embody the Rio Principles more firmly in law and practice.

9. **(Agreed)** A number of major United Nations conferences have advanced international commitment for the achievement of long-term goals and objectives towards sustainable development.

10. **(Agreed)** Organizations and programmes of the United Nations system have played an important role in making progress in the implementation of Agenda 21. The Commission on Sustainable Development was established to review progress achieved in the implementation of Agenda 21, advance global dialogue and foster partnerships for sustainable development. The Commission has catalysed new action and commitments and has contributed to the deliberations on sustainable development among a wide variety of partners within and outside the United Nations system. Although much remains to be done, progress has also been made at the national, regional and international levels in implementing the UNCED Forest Principles,[6] including through the Commission's Ad Hoc Intergovernmental Panel on Forests.

11. **(Agreed)** Provision of adequate and predictable financial resources and the transfer of environmentally sound technologies to developing countries are critical elements for the implementation of Agenda 21. However, while some progress has been made, much remains to be done to activate the means of implementation set out in Agenda 21, in particular in the areas of finance and technology transfer, technical assistance and capacity-building.

12. **(Agreed)** Most developed countries have still not reached the United Nations target, reaffirmed by most countries at UNCED, of committing 0.7 per cent of their gross national product (GNP) to official development assistance or the United Nations target, as agreed, of committing 0.15 per cent of GNP as ODA to the least developed countries. Regrettably, on average, ODA as a percentage of the GNP of developed countries has drastically declined in the post-UNCED period, from 0.34 per cent in 1992 to 0.27 per cent in 1995, but ODA has taken more account of the need for an integrated approach to sustainable development.

/...

13. **(Agreed)** In other areas, results have been encouraging since UNCED. There has been a sizeable expansion of private flows of financial resources from developed to a limited number of developing countries and, in a number of countries, efforts have been made in support of domestic resource mobilization, including the increasing use of economic instruments to promote sustainable development.

14. **(Agreed)** In many developing countries, the debt situation remains a major constraint to achieving sustainable development. Although the debt situation of some middle-income countries has improved, there is a need to continue to address the debt problems of the heavily indebted poor countries, which continue to face unsustainable external debt burdens. The recent World Bank/International Monetary Fund (IMF) Heavily Indebted Poor Countries Initiative could help to address that issue with the cooperation of all creditor countries. Further efforts by the international community are still required to remove debt as an impediment to sustainable development.

15. **(Agreed)** Similarly, technology transfer and technology-related investment from public and private sources, which are particularly important to developing countries, has not been realized as outlined in Agenda 21. Although increased private flows have led to investments in industry and technology in some developing countries and economies in transition, many other countries have been left behind. Conditions in some of these countries have been less attractive to private sector investment and technological change has been slower, thus limiting their ability to meet their commitments to Agenda 21 and other international agreements. The technology gap between developed countries and, in particular, the least developed countries has widened.

C. Implementation in areas requiring urgent action

16. Agenda 21 and the principles contained in the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development established a comprehensive approach to the achievement of sustainable development. While it is the primary responsibility of national Governments to achieve the economic, social and environmental objectives of Agenda 21, it is essential that international cooperation be reactivated and intensified, recognizing, inter alia, the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities as stated in principle 7 of the Rio Declaration. This requires the mobilization of stronger political will and the invigoration of a genuine new global partnership, taking into account the special needs and priorities of developing countries. That approach remains as relevant and as urgently needed as ever. It is clear from the assessment above that, although progress has been made in some areas, a major new effort will be required to achieve the goals established at UNCED **[particularly][including]** in the area of cross-sectoral matters where implementation has yet to be achieved. The proposals set out in sections 1-3 below outline strategies for accelerating progress towards sustainable development. The sections are equally important and must be considered and implemented in a balanced and integrated way.

/...

1. Integration of economic, social and environmental objectives

17. There is a mutually reinforcing relationship between economic, social and environmental objectives. **[Sustained economic growth is essential to the economic and social development of all countries, in particular developing countries.]** Growth can foster development only if its benefits are fully shared. It must therefore also be guided by equity, justice and social and environmental considerations. Development, in turn, must involve measures that improve the human condition and the quality of life itself. **[Democracy, respect for all human rights and fundamental freedoms, transparent and accountable governance in all sectors of society, as well as the effective participation of civil society, are indispensable foundations for the realization of sustainable development.]**

18. **(Agreed)** Sustainable development strategies are important mechanisms for enhancing and linking national capacity so as to bring together priorities in social, economic and environmental policies. Hence, special attention must be given to the fulfilment of commitments in the areas set out below, in the framework of an integrated approach towards development, consisting of mutually reinforcing measures to sustain economic growth, as well as to promote social development and environmental protection. Achieving sustainable development cannot be done without greater integration at all policy-making levels and at operational levels, including the lowest administrative levels possible. Economic sectors, such as industry, agriculture, energy, transport and tourism, must take responsibility for the impact of their activities on human well-being and the physical environment. In the context of good governance, properly constructed strategies can enhance prospects for economic growth and employment and at the same time protect the environment. All sectors of society should be involved in their development and implementation, as follows:

(a) **(Agreed)** By the year 2002, the formulation and elaboration of national strategies for sustainable development which reflect the contributions and responsibilities of all interested parties should be completed in all countries, with assistance provided, as appropriate, through international cooperation, taking into account the special needs of the least developed countries. The efforts of developing countries in effectively implementing national strategies should be supported. Countries which already have national strategies should continue their efforts to enhance and effectively implement them. Assessment of progress achieved and exchange of experience among Governments should be promoted. Local Agenda 21 and other local sustainable development programmes, including youth activities, should also be actively encouraged;

(b) **(Agreed)** In integrating economic, social and environmental objectives, it is important that a broad package of policy instruments, including regulation, economic instruments, internalization of environmental costs in market prices, environmental and social impact analysis and information, be worked out in the light of country-specific conditions to ensure that integrated approaches are effective and cost-efficient. To this end, a transparent and participatory process should be promoted. This will require the involvement of national legislative assemblies, as well as all actors of civil society, including youth and indigenous people**[s]**, to complement the efforts of Governments for sustainable development. In particular, the empowerment and the full and equal participation of women in all spheres of society, including participation in the decision-making process, is central to all efforts to achieve such development;

[(c) The implementation of policies aiming at sustainable development, including protection of the environment, may enhance the opportunities for job creation - while protecting basic worker rights - thus helping to achieve the fundamental goal of eradicating poverty.]

[EU proposed sentence on environment to be added]

[**Enabling international economic environment**]

19. (**Agreed**) A mutually supportive balance between the international and the national environment is needed in the pursuit of sustainable development. As a result of globalization, external factors have become critical in determining the success or failure of developing countries in their national efforts. The gap between developed and developing countries points to the continued need for a dynamic and enabling international economic environment supportive of international cooperation, particularly in the fields of finance, technology transfer, debt and trade, if the momentum for global progress towards sustainable development is to be maintained and increased.

20. To foster a dynamic and enabling international economic environment favourable to all countries is in the interest of all countries. And issues, including environmental issues, that bear on the international economic environment can be approached effectively only through a constructive dialogue and genuine partnership on the basis of mutuality of interests and benefits and, **[in regard to environmental issues]** inter alia, the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities, as stated in principle 7 of the Rio Declaration.

Eradicating poverty

21. **(Agreed)** Noting the severity of poverty, particularly in developing countries, the eradication of poverty is one of the fundamental goals of the international community and the entire United Nations system, as reflected in commitment 2 of the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development,[7] and is essential for sustainable development. Poverty eradication is thus an overriding theme of sustainable development for the coming years. The enormity and complexity of the poverty issue could very well endanger the social fabric, undermine economic development and the environment, and threaten political stability in many countries. To achieve poverty eradication, efforts of individual Governments and international cooperation and assistance should be brought together in a complementary way. Eradication of poverty depends on the full integration of people living in poverty into economic, social and political life. The empowerment of women is a critical factor for the eradication of poverty. Policies that promote such integration to combat poverty, in particular policies for providing basic social services and broader socio-economic development, are effective as well since enhancing the productive capacity of poor people increases both their well-being and that of their communities and societies, and facilitates their participation in resource

conservation and environmental protection. The provision of basic social services and food security in an equitable way is a necessary condition for such integration and empowerment. The 20/20 initiative as referred to in the Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development[8] is, among other things, a useful means for such integration. However, the five years since the Rio Conference have witnessed an increase in the number of people living in absolute poverty, particularly in developing countries. In this context, there is an urgent need for the timely and full implementation of all the relevant commitments, agreements and targets already agreed upon since the Rio Conference by the international community, including the United Nations system and international financial institutions. Full implementation of the Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development is essential. Priority actions include:

(a) **(Agreed)** Improving access to sustainable livelihoods, entrepreneurial opportunities and productive resources, including land, water, credit, technical and administrative training, and appropriate technology, with particular efforts to broaden the human and social capital basis of societies to reach the rural poor and the urban informal sector;

[(a bis)* Ensuring access of people living in poverty to micro-credit in order to enable them to undertake micro-enterprises, which would in turn generate self-employment and contribute to achieving empowerment, especially of women, and encouraging the strengthening and establishment of institutions supportive of micro-lending programmes.]

(b) **(Agreed)** Providing universal access to basic social services, including basic education, health care, nutrition, clean water and sanitation;

(c) **(Agreed)** Progressively developing, in accordance with the financial and administrative capacities of each society, social protection systems to support those who cannot support themselves, either temporarily or permanently; the aim of social integration is to create a "society for all";

(d) Empowering people living in poverty and their organizations by involving them fully in the implementation **[, monitoring and assessment]** of strategies and programmes for poverty eradication and community development **[and by ensuring that these programmes reflect their priorities and perceptions;]**

(e) Addressing the disproportionate impact of poverty on women, in particular by removing legislative, policy, administrative and customary barriers to women's equal access to productive resources and services, including access to and control over land and other forms of property, credit, including micro-credit, inheritance, education, information, health care and technology. In this regard, full implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action[9] **[consistent with the report of the Fourth World Conference on Women]** is essential;

*** This subparagraph was not negotiated, but was included at the request of Bangladesh.**

/...

(f) **(Agreed)** Interested donors and recipients working together to allocate increased shares of ODA to poverty eradication. The 20/20 initiative is an important principle in this respect, as it is based on a mutual commitment among donors and recipients to increase resources allocated to basic social services;

(g) **(Agreed)** Intensifying international cooperation to support measures being taken in developing countries to eradicate poverty, to provide basic social protection and services, and to approach poverty eradication efforts in an integral and multidimensional manner.

Changing consumption and production patterns

22. Unsustainable patterns of production and consumption, particularly in the industrialized countries, are identified in Agenda 21 as the major cause of continued deterioration of the global environment. **[While unsustainable patterns in the industrialized countries continue to aggravate the threats to the environment, particularly excessive pollution from greenhouse gases, there remain huge difficulties for developing countries in meeting basic needs such as food, health care, shelter and education for people.] [Similar patterns are emerging in the higher income groups in some developing countries.]** Consistent with Agenda 21, the development and further elaboration of national policies and strategies, particularly in industrialized countries, are needed to encourage changes in unsustainable consumption and production patterns, while strengthening, as appropriate, international approaches **[and policies]** that promote sustainable consumption patterns on the basis of the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities, applying the polluter pays principle, encouraging producer responsibility and greater consumer awareness. Eco-efficiency, cost internalization and product policies are also important tools for making consumption and production patterns more sustainable. Actions in this area should focus on:

(a) Promoting measures to internalize environmental costs and benefits in the price of goods and services, while seeking to avoid potential negative effects for market access by developing countries, particularly with a view to encouraging the use of environmentally preferable products and commodities **[and moving towards pricing natural resources in a way that reflects full costs]**. Governments should consider shifting the burden of taxation on to unsustainable patterns of production and consumption; it is of vital importance to achieve such an internalization of environmental costs. Such tax reforms should include a socially responsible process of reduction and elimination of subsidies to environmentally harmful activities;

(b) **[Taking] [Encouraging]** measures aimed at promoting the role of business in shaping more sustainable patterns of consumption **[by publishing environmental and social audits on its own activities and]** by acting as an agent of change in the market, and by virtue of its role as a major consumer of goods and services;

(c) Developing core indicators to monitor critical trends in consumption and production patterns **[particularly in the industrialized countries]**;

(d) **(Agreed)** Identifying best practices through evaluations of policy measures with respect to their environmental effectiveness, efficiency and implications for social equity, and disseminating such evaluations;

(e) **(Agreed)** Taking into account the linkages between urbanization and the environmental and developmental effects of consumption and production patterns in cities, thus promoting more sustainable patterns of urbanization;

(f) Promoting international and national **[targets, goals or action]** programmes for energy and material efficiency with timetables for their implementation, as appropriate. In this regard, attention should be given to studies that propose to improve the efficiency of resource use **[and consider a tenfold improvement in resource productivity in the long term]**. **[As an intermediate step, an increase in resource productivity, for example, by a factor of four in the next two or three decades seems to be within reach.]** Further research is required to study the feasibility of these goals and the practical measures needed for their implementation. Industrialized countries will have a special responsibility and must take the lead in this respect. The Commission on Sustainable Development should consider this initiative in the coming years in exploring policies and measures necessary to implement eco-efficiency **[and for this purpose, adopt measures aimed at assisting developing countries to improve energy and material efficiency through the promotion of their endogenous capacity-building and economic development with enhanced and effective international support]**;

(g) Encouraging Governments to take the lead in changing consumption patterns by improving their own environmental performance with action-oriented policies and goals on procurement, the management of public facilities and the further integration of environmental concerns into national policy-making **[, with the full cooperation of developed countries, which are called upon to take the lead in changing consumption patterns]**;

(h) Encouraging the media, advertising and marketing sectors to help shape sustainable consumption **[and production]** patterns;

(i) **(Agreed)** Improving the quality of information regarding the environmental impact of products and services and, to that end, encouraging the voluntary and transparent use of eco-labelling;

(j) Promoting measures favouring eco-efficiency; however, developed countries should pay special attention to the needs of developing countries, in particular by encouraging positive impacts, and **[seeking to avoid] [avoiding]** negative impacts on export opportunities and market access for developing countries **[and, as appropriate, for countries with economies in transition]**;

(k) **(Agreed)** Encouraging the development and strengthening of educational programmes to promote sustainable consumption and production patterns;

(l) **(Agreed)** Encouraging business and industry to develop and apply environmentally sound technology that should aim not only at increasing competitiveness but also at reducing negative environmental impacts;

/...

(m) **(Agreed)** Giving balanced consideration to both the demand side and the supply side of the economy in matching environmental concerns and economic factors, which could encourage changes in the behaviour of consumers and producers. A number of policy options should be examined; they include regulatory instruments, economic and social incentives and disincentives, facilities and infrastructure, information, education, and technology development and dissemination.

Making trade and environment mutually supportive

23. In order to accelerate economic growth, poverty eradication and environmental protection, particularly in developing countries, there is a need to establish macroeconomic conditions in both developed and developing countries that favour the development of instruments and structures enabling all countries, in particular developing countries, to benefit from globalization. International cooperation and support for capacity-building in trade, environment and development should be strengthened through renewed system-wide efforts, and with greater responsiveness to sustainable development objectives, by the United Nations, the World Trade Organization (WTO), the Bretton Woods institutions, as well as by national Governments. There should be a balanced and integrated approach to trade and sustainable development, based on a combination of trade liberalization, economic development and environmental protection. Trade obstacles should be removed with a view to contributing to achieving more efficient use of the earth's natural resources in both economic and environmental terms. Trade liberalization should be accompanied by environmental and resource management policies in order to realize its full potential contribution to improved environmental protection and the promotion of sustainable development through the more efficient allocation and use of resources. The multilateral trading system should have the capacity to further integrate environmental considerations and enhance its contribution to sustainable development, without undermining its open, equitable and non-discriminatory character. The special and differential treatment for developing countries, especially the least developed countries, and the other commitments of the Uruguay Round of multilateral trade negotiations should be fully implemented in order to enable those countries to benefit from the international trading system, while conserving the environment. There is a need for continuing the elimination of discriminatory and protectionist practices in international trade relations **[particularly those affecting developing countries and countries with economies in transition]**. In order to make trade, environment and development mutually supportive, measures need to be taken to ensure transparency in the use of trade measures related to the environment, and should address the root causes of environmental degradation so as not to result in disguised barriers to trade. Account should be taken of the fact that environmental standards valid for developed countries may have unwarranted social and economic costs in other countries, in particular developing countries. International cooperation is needed and unilateralism should be avoided. The following actions are required:

(a) **(Agreed)** Timely and full implementation of the results of the Uruguay Round of multilateral trade negotiations[10] and full use of the Comprehensive and Integrated WTO Plan of Action for the Least Developed Countries;[11]

(b) Promotion of an open, non-discriminatory, rule-based, equitable, secure, transparent and predictable multilateral trading system. In this context, effective measures are called for to achieve the complete integration of developing countries and countries with economies in transition into the world economy and the new international trading system. In this connection, there is a need to promote the universality of WTO and to facilitate the admission to membership in that organization in a mutually beneficial way, of developing countries and countries with economies in transition applying for membership. Actions should be taken to maximize the opportunities and to minimize the difficulties of developing countries, including the net food-importing ones, especially the least developed countries, and of countries with economies in transition in adjusting to the changes introduced by the Uruguay Round. **[Sustainable development and trade liberalization should be mutually supportive.]** The relationship between multilateral environmental agreements and the WTO rules should be clarified;

(c) **(Agreed)** Implementation of environmental measures should not result in disguised barriers to trade;

(d) **(Agreed)** Within the framework of Agenda 21, trade rules and environmental principles should interact harmoniously;

(e) **(Agreed)** Further analysis of the environmental effects of the international transport of goods is warranted;

(f)* Cooperation and coordination between the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), WTO, UNEP and other relevant institutions should be strengthened on various issues, including (i) the role of positive measures in multilateral environmental agreements as part of a package of measures including, in certain cases, trade measures; (ii) the special conditions and needs of small and medium-sized enterprises in the trade and environment interface; (iii) trade and environment issues at the regional and subregional levels, including in the context of regional economic and trade as well as environmental agreements; (iv) environment and sustainable development issues in the context of domestic and foreign direct investment, including a possible multilateral framework on investment; any future agreement on investment liberalization should be consistent with the objectives of sustainable development;

[(f bis) The promotion of effective dialogue with major groups (including non-governmental organizations) within the WTO Committee on Trade and Environment.]**

---

* India and Indonesia reserved their position on this subparagraph and wished that fact to be recorded in the final report of the session. This was endorsed by the Group of 77 and China.

**** This subparagraph was not negotiated, but was included at the request of Australia.**

/...

(g) **(Agreed)** National Governments should make every effort to ensure policy coordination on trade, environment and development at the national level in support of sustainable development;

[(h) Action in WTO to ensure that trade rules do not prevent or undermine effective and legitimate environmental policies and measures at the international, regional and national levels, including further steps to ensure that WTO rules pay due respect to the decisions of Governments acting jointly in negotiating multilateral environmental agreements and that they support the effective implementation of the different measures provided for in the framework of such agreements.]

Population

24. The impact of the relationship between economic growth, poverty, employment, environment and sustainable development has become a major concern. There is a need to recognize the critical linkages between demographic trends and factors and sustainable development. The current decline in population growth rates must be further promoted through national and international policies that promote economic development, social development, environmental protection, poverty eradication, particularly the further expansion of basic education, with full and equal access for girls and women, and health care, including **[reproductive health care, [which covers] [including] both family planning and sexual health, consistent with the report of the International Conference on Population and Development[12]] [as well as family and maternal health care]**.

Health

25. The goals of sustainable development cannot be achieved when a high proportion of the population is afflicted with debilitating illnesses. An overriding goal for the future is to implement the Health for All strategy[13] and to enable all people, particularly the world's poor, to achieve a higher level of health and well-being, and to improve their economic productivity and social potential. Protecting children from environmental health threats and infectious disease is particularly urgent since children are more susceptible than adults to those threats. Top priority should be attached to supporting the efforts of countries, particularly developing countries, and international organizations to eradicate the major infectious diseases, especially malaria, which is on the increase, to improve and expand basic health and sanitation services, and to provide safe drinking water. It is also important to reduce indigenous cases of vaccine-preventable diseases through the promotion of widespread immunization programmes, promote accelerated research and vaccine development and reduce the transmission of other major infectious diseases, such as dengue fever, tuberculosis and HIV/AIDS. **[Given the devastating and irreparable effects that lead poisoning has on children, it is important to continue to give emphasis to eliminating lead from gasoline worldwide.]** Strategies at the regional, national and local levels for reducing the potential risk due to ambient and indoor air pollution should be developed, bearing in mind their serious impacts on human health **[including strategies to make parents, families and communities aware of the adverse environmental health impacts of tobacco]**. The clear linkage between health and the environment needs to be emphasized and the lack of information on

the impact of environmental pollution on health should be addressed. Health issues should be fully integrated into national and subnational sustainable development plans and should be incorporated into project and programme development as a component of environmental impact assessments. Important to efforts at national levels is international cooperation in disease prevention, early warning, surveillance, reporting, training and research, and treatment.

Sustainable human settlements

26. **(Agreed)** Sustainable human settlements development is essential to sustainable development. The need to intensify efforts and cooperation to improve living conditions in the cities, towns, villages and rural areas throughout the world is recognized. Approximately half the world's population already lives in urban settlements, and by early in the next century the majority - more than 5 billion people - will be urban residents. Urban problems are concerns common to both developed and developing countries, although urbanization is occurring most rapidly in developing countries. Urbanization creates both challenges and opportunities. Global urbanization is a cross-sectoral phenomenon which has an impact on all aspects of sustainable development. Urgent action is needed to implement fully the commitments made at the United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II) consistent with its report,[14] and in Agenda 21. New and additional financial resources from various sources are necessary to achieve the goals of adequate shelter for all and sustainable human settlements development in an urbanizing world. Transfer of expertise and technology, capacity-building, decentralization of authority through, inter alia, strengthening of local capacity and private-public partnerships to improve the provision and environmentally sound management of infrastructure and social services should be accelerated to achieve more sustainable human settlements development. Local Agenda 21 programmes should also be actively encouraged. Global targets could be established by the Commission on Sustainable Development to promote Local Agenda 21 campaigns and to deal with obstacles to Local Agenda 21 initiatives.

2. Sectors and issues

27. **(Agreed)** The present section identifies a number of specific areas that are of widespread concern since failure to reverse current trends in these areas, notably in resource degradation, will have potentially disastrous effects on social and economic development, on human health and on environmental protection for all countries, particularly developing countries. All sectors covered by Agenda 21 are equally important and thus deserve attention by the international community on an equal footing. The need for integration is important in all sectors, including the areas of energy and transport because of the adverse effects that developments in those areas can have on human health and ecosystems; the areas of agriculture and water use, where inadequate land-use planning, poor water management and inappropriate technology can result in the degradation of natural resources and human impoverishment and where drought and desertification can result in land degradation and soil loss; and the area of management of marine resources, where competitive overexploitation can damage the resource base, food supplies and the livelihood of fishing communities, as well as the environment. The recommendations made in each of the sectors take

/...

into account the need for international cooperation in support of national efforts, within the context of the principles of UNCED, including, inter alia, the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities. It is likewise understood that these recommendations do not in any way prejudice the work accomplished under legally binding conventions, where they exist, concerning these sectors.

Freshwater

28. **(Agreed)** Water resources are essential for satisfying basic human needs, health and food production, and the preservation of ecosystems, as well as for economic and social development in general. It is a matter of urgent concern that more than one fifth of all people still do not have access to safe drinking water and more than one half of humanity lacks adequate sanitation. From the perspective of developing countries, freshwater is a priority and a basic need, especially taking into account that in many developing countries freshwater is not readily available for all segments of the population, inter alia, owing to lack of adequate infrastructure and capacity, water scarcity, and technical and financial constraints. Moreover, freshwater is also crucial for developing countries to satisfy the basic needs of their population in the areas of agricultural irrigation, industrial development, hydroelectric generation, and so forth. In view of the growing demands on water, which is a finite resource, water will become a major limiting factor in socio-economic development unless early action is taken. There is growing concern at the increasing stress on water supplies caused by unsustainable use patterns, affecting both water quality and quantity, and the widespread lack of access to safe water supply and suitable sanitation in many developing countries. Because the commitments of the International Drinking Water Supply and Sanitation Decade of the 1980s have not been fully met, there is still a need to ensure the optimal use and protection of all freshwater resources, so that the needs, including the availability of safe drinking water and sanitation, of everyone on this planet can be met. This calls for the highest priority to be given to the serious freshwater problems facing many regions, especially in the developing world. There is an urgent need to:

(a) **(Agreed)** Assign high priority, in accordance with specific national needs and conditions, to the formulation and implementation of policies and programmes for integrated watershed management, including issues related to pollution and waste, the interrelationship between water and land, including mountains, forests, upstream and downstream users, estuarine environments, biodiversity and the preservation of aquatic ecosystems, wetlands, climate and land degradation and desertification, recognizing that subnational, national and regional approaches to freshwater protection and consumption following a watershed basin or river basin approach offer a useful model for the protection of freshwater supplies;

(b) **(Agreed)** Strengthen regional and international cooperation for technological transfer and the financing of integrated water resources programmes and projects, in particular those designed to increase access to safe water supply and sanitation;

(c) **(Agreed)** Ensure the continued participation of local communities, and women in particular, in the management of water resources development and use;

(d) **(Agreed)** Provide an enabling national and international environment that encourages investments from public and private sources to improve water supply and sanitation services, especially in fast-growing urban and peri-urban areas, as well as in poor rural communities in developing countries. Adopt and implement commitments by the international community to support the efforts to assist developing countries achieve access to safe drinking water and sanitation for all;

(e) **(Agreed)** Recognize water as a social and economic good with a vital role in the satisfaction of basic human needs, food security, poverty alleviation and the protection of ecosystems. Economic valuation of water should be seen within the context of its social and economic implications, reflecting the importance of meeting basic needs. Consideration should be given to the gradual implementation of pricing policies that are geared towards cost recovery and the equitable and efficient allocation of water, including the promotion of water conservation, in developed countries; such policies could also be considered in developing countries when they reach an appropriate stage in their development, so as to promote the harmonious management and development of scarce water resources and generate financial resources for investment in new water supply and treatment facilities. Such strategies should also include programmes assigned to minimize wasteful consumption of water;

(f) **(Agreed)** Strengthen the capability of Governments and international institutions to collect and manage information, including scientific, social and environmental data, in order to facilitate the integrated assessment and management of water resources, and foster regional and international cooperation for information dissemination and exchange through cooperative approaches among United Nations institutions, including UNEP, and centres for environmental excellence. In this regard, technical assistance to developing countries will continue to be important;

(g) **(Agreed)** Give support by the international community to the efforts and limited resources of developing countries to shift to higher-value, less water-intensive modes of agricultural and industrial production and to develop the educational and informational infrastructure necessary to improve the skills of the labour force required for the economic transformation that needs to take place if use of freshwater resources is to be sustainable. International support for the integrated development of water resources in developing countries, appropriate innovative initiatives and approaches at the bilateral and regional levels are also required;

(h) **(Agreed)** Encourage watercourse States to develop international watercourses with a view to attaining sustainable utilization and appropriate protection thereof and benefits therefrom, taking into account the interests of the watercourse States concerned.

/...

29.* **(Agreed)** Considering the urgent need for action in the field of freshwater, and building on existing principles and instruments, arrangements, programmes of action and customary uses of water, Governments call for a dialogue under the aegis of the Commission on Sustainable Development, beginning at its sixth session, aimed at building a consensus on the necessary actions, and in particular, on the means of implementation and on tangible results, in order to consider initiating a strategic approach for the implementation of all aspects of the sustainable use of freshwater for social and economic purposes, including, inter alia, safe drinking water and sanitation, water for irrigation, recycling, and wastewater management, and the important role freshwater plays in natural ecosystems. This intergovernmental process will be fully fruitful only if there is a proved commitment by the international community for the provision of new and additional financial resources for the goals of this initiative.

Oceans and seas

30. **(Agreed)** Progress has been achieved since UNCED in the negotiation of agreements and voluntary instruments for improving the conservation and management of fishery resources and for the protection of the marine environment. Furthermore, progress has been made in the conservation and management of specific fishery stocks for securing the sustainable utilization of these resources. Despite this, the decline of many fish stocks, high levels of discards, and rising marine pollution continue. Governments should take full advantage of the challenge and opportunity presented by the International Year of the Ocean in 1998. There is a need to continue to improve decision-making at the national, regional and global levels. To address the need for improving global decision-making on the marine environment, there is an urgent need for Governments to implement decision 4/15 of the Commission on Sustainable Development,[15] in which the Commission, inter alia, called for periodic intergovernmental reviews by the Commission of all aspects of the marine environment and its related issues, as described in chapter 17 of Agenda 21, for which the overall legal framework is provided by UNCLOS. There is a need for concerted action by all countries and for improved cooperation to assist developing countries in implementing the relevant agreements and instruments in order to participate effectively in the sustainable use, conservation and management of their fishery resources, as provided for in UNCLOS and other international legal instruments and to achieve integrated coastal zone management. In that context, there is an urgent need for:

(a)* **(Agreed)** All Governments to ratify or to accede to the relevant agreements as soon as possible and to implement effectively such agreements as well as relevant voluntary instruments;

(b) **(Agreed)** All Governments to implement General Assembly resolution 51/189 of 16 December 1996, including the strengthening of institutional links to be established between the relevant intergovernmental mechanisms involved in the development and implementation of integrated coastal zone management.

---

* Turkey reserved its position on this subparagraph, and wished that fact to be recorded in the final report of the session.

Following progress on UNCLOS, and bearing in mind principle 13 of the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, there is a need to strengthen the implementation of existing international and regional agreements on marine pollution, with a view in particular to better contingency planning, response, and liability and compensation mechanisms;

(c) **(Agreed)** Better identification of priorities for action at the global level to promote the conservation and sustainable use of the marine environment, as well as better means for integrating such action;

(d) **(Agreed)** Further international cooperation to support the strengthening, where needed, of regional and subregional agreements for the protection and sustainable use of the oceans and seas;

(e) **(Agreed)** Governments to prevent or eliminate overfishing and excess fishing capacity through the adoption of management measures and mechanisms to ensure the sustainable management and utilization of fishery resources and to undertake programmes of work to achieve the reduction and elimination of wasteful fishing practices, wherever they may occur, especially in relation to large-scale industrialized fishing. The emphasis given by the Commission on Sustainable Development at its fourth session to the importance of effective conservation and management of fish stocks, and in particular to eliminating overfishing, in order to identify specific steps at the national or regional levels to prevent or eliminate excess fishing capacity, will need to be carried forward in all appropriate international forums including, in particular, the Committee on Fisheries of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO);

(f) **(Agreed)** Governments to consider the positive and negative impact of subsidies on the conservation and management of fisheries through national, regional and appropriate international organizations and, based on these analyses, to consider appropriate action;

(g) **(Agreed)** Governments to take actions, individually and through their participation in competent global and regional forums, to improve the quality and quantity of scientific data as a basis for effective decisions related to the protection of the marine environment and the conservation and management of marine living resources; in this regard, greater international cooperation is required to assist developing countries, in particular small island developing States, to operationalize data networks and clearing houses for information-sharing on oceans. In this context, particular emphasis must be placed on the collection of biological and other fisheries-related information and the resources for its collation, analysis and dissemination.

Forests

31. **(Agreed)** The management, conservation and sustainable development of all types of forests is a crucial factor in economic and social development, in environmental protection and in the planet's life support system. Forests are one of the major reservoirs of biological diversity; they act as carbon sinks and reservoirs; they are a significant source of renewable energy, particularly in the least developed countries, and an integral part of sustainable development.

32. **(Agreed)** Since the adoption of the Forest Principles at the Rio Conference, tangible progress has been made in sustainable forest management at the national, subregional, regional and international levels and in the promotion of international cooperation on forests. The proposals for action contained in the report of the Ad Hoc Intergovernmental Panel on Forests (IPF) (E/CN.17/1997/12), which were endorsed by the Commission on Sustainable Development at its fifth session,[16] represent significant progress and consensus on a wide range of forest issues.

33. **(Agreed)** To maintain the momentum generated by the IPF process and to facilitate and encourage the holistic, integrated and balanced intergovernmental policy dialogue on all types of forests in the future, which continues to be an open, transparent and participatory process, requires a long-term political commitment to sustainable forest management worldwide. Against this background, there is an urgent need for:

(a) **(Agreed)** Countries and international organizations and institutions to implement the proposals for action agreed by the Panel, in an expeditious and effective manner, and in collaboration and through effective partnership with all interested parties, including major groups, in particular indigenous people and local communities;

(b) **(Agreed)** Countries to develop national forest programmes in accordance with their respective national conditions, objectives and priorities;

(c) **(Agreed)** Enhanced international cooperation to implement the Panel's proposals for action directed towards the management, conservation and sustainable development of all types of forests, including provision for financial resources, capacity-building, research and the transfer of technology;

(d) Further clarification of all issues arising from the IPF process, in particular international cooperation in financial assistance and technology transfer, and trade and environment in relation to forest products and services **[, as well as traditional forest-related knowledge]**;

(e) **(Agreed)** International institutions and organizations to continue their work and to undertake further coordination and explore means for collaboration in the informal, high-level Inter-Agency Task Force on Forests, focusing on the implementation of the Panel's proposals for action, in accordance with their respective mandates and comparative advantage;

/...

(f) **(Agreed)** Countries to provide consistent guidance to the governing bodies of relevant international institutions and instruments to take efficient and effective measures, as well as to coordinate their forest-related work at all levels, in incorporating the Panel's proposals for action into their work programmes and under existing agreements and arrangements.

[34. To [**help**] achieve this and to facilitate and promote the implementation of the proposals for action in the Panel's report, the following options are proposed:

(a) To continue the intergovernmental policy dialogue on forests through the establishment of an ad hoc, open-ended intergovernmental forum on forests under the auspices of the Commission on Sustainable Development, with a focused and time-limited mandate, charged with, inter alia, reviewing, monitoring and reporting on progress in the management, conservation and sustainable development of all types of forests; promoting and monitoring the implementation of the Panel's proposals for action; and either:

(i) On that basis, considering and advising on the need for other arrangements and mechanisms, including legal arrangements covering all types of forests, and reporting on these matters to the Commission at the appropriate time in accordance with its work programme, which has yet to be defined; and/or

(ii) Preparing the basis and building the necessary consensus for a decision to negotiate and elaborate possible elements of a legally binding instrument, and reporting on its work on that topic to the Commission in 1999;

OR

(b) To carry forward intergovernmental policy action on forests through the establishment, as soon as possible, under the authority of the General Assembly, of an intergovernmental negotiating committee on a legally binding instrument on all types of forest, with a focused and time-limited mandate.

OR

[Alternative paragraph 34] To continue the intergovernmental policy dialogue on forests through the establishment of an ad hoc open-ended intergovernmental forum on forests under the aegis of the Commission on Sustainable Development, with a focused and time-limited mandate, charged with promoting and facilitating the implementation of the Panel's proposals for action and reporting on progress in the management, conservation and sustainable development of all types of forests; with considering matters left pending by the Panel, in particular, trade in forest products and services and the environment, transfer of technology, and the need for financial resources; as well as with considering the need for and identifying possible elements of arrangements and mechanisms or a legally binding instrument. The forum will report on its work to the Commission in 1999 for appropriate action.]

[Note: The terms of reference for an appropriate intergovernmental process will need to be developed.]

Energy

35. Energy is essential to economic and social development and improved quality of life. However, sustainable patterns of production, distribution and use of energy are crucial. Fossil fuels (coal, oil and natural gas) will continue to dominate the energy supply situation for many years to come in most developed and developing countries. What is required then is to reduce the environmental impact of their continued development, and to reduce local health hazards and environmental pollution through enhanced international cooperation **[notably in the provision of concessional finance for capacity development and transfer of the relevant technology].**

36. **(Agreed)** In developing countries sharp increases in energy services are required to improve the standard of living of their growing populations. The increase in the level of energy services would have a beneficial impact on poverty eradication by increasing employment opportunities and improving transportation, health and education. Many developing countries, in particular the least developed, face the urgent need to provide adequate modern energy services, especially to billions of people in rural areas. This requires significant financial, human and technical resources and a broad-based mix of energy sources.

37. **(Agreed)** The objectives envisaged in this section should reflect the need for equity, adequate energy supplies and increasing energy consumption in developing countries and should take into account the situation of countries that are highly dependent on income generated from the production, processing and export, and/or consumption of fossil fuels and that have serious difficulties in switching to alternative sources of energy, and the situation of countries highly vulnerable to adverse effects of climate change.

38. **(Agreed)** Advances towards sustainable energy use are taking place and all parties can benefit from progress made in other countries. It is also necessary to ensure international cooperation for promoting energy conservation and improvement of energy efficiency, the use of renewable energy and research, and the development and dissemination of innovative energy-related technology.

39. Therefore there is a need for:

[(a) A shift towards sustainable patterns of production, distribution and use. This should be taken up by elaborating a common strategy for a sustainable energy future. In this way, Governments should commit themselves to developing and promoting sustainable energy policies, involving all actors. To advance this work at the intergovernmental level the Commission on Sustainable Development should devote one of its sessions in the near future to the establishment of such a common strategy. This dedicated session should be thoroughly prepared by an inter-sessional high-level forum of the Commission on environment and energy. The Committee on New and Renewable Sources of Energy and on Energy for Development should be involved;]

/...

OR

[(a) A movement towards sustainable patterns of production, distribution and use of energy. To advance this work at the intergovernmental level, the Commission on Sustainable Development will discuss energy issues at its [ninth] session. Noting the vital role of energy in the continuation of sustainable economic growth, especially for developing countries, in particular those countries that play a key role in the world's energy supply, and recognizing the complexities and interdependencies inherent in addressing energy issues within the context of sustainable development, preparations for this meeting should take place over a longer time frame in an open-ended intergovernmental group of experts on energy and sustainable development to be held in conjunction with inter-sessional meetings of the Commission. In line with the objectives of Agenda 21, the meeting of the Commission should contribute to a sustainable energy future for all;]

(b) **(Agreed)** Evolving concrete measures to strengthen international cooperation in order to assist developing countries in their domestic efforts to provide adequate modern energy services, especially electricity, to all sections of their population, particularly in rural areas, in an environmentally sound manner;

(c) **(Agreed)** Countries, bearing in mind the specific needs and priorities of developing countries, to promote policies and plans that take into account the economic, social and environmental aspects of the production, distribution and use of energy, including the use of lower pollutant sources of energy such as natural gas;

(d) Evolving **[time-bound commitments for]** the transfer of relevant technology to developing countries and economies in transition so as to enable them to increase the use of renewable energy sources and cleaner fossil fuels and to improve efficiency in energy production, distribution and use. Countries need to systematically increase the use of renewable energy sources according to their specific social, economic, natural, geographical and climatic conditions and cleaner fuel technologies, including fossil fuel technologies, and to improve efficiency in energy production, distribution and use and in other industrial production processes that are intensive users of energy;

(e) **(Agreed)** Promoting efforts in research on and development and use of renewable energy technologies at the international and national levels;

(f) In the context of fossil fuels, encouraging further research, development, and the application and transfer of technology, **[preferably]** of a cleaner and more efficient nature, through effective international support;

[(g) Encouraging Governments and the private sector to move towards energy pricing that better reflects economic, social and environmental costs and benefits, including the reduction and the gradual elimination of subsidies for energy production and consumption that inhibit sustainable development. Such policies should take fully into account the specific needs and conditions of developing countries [, while respecting the agreed special and differentiated

treatment of developing countries, particularly least developed countries, in WTO, on the question of subsidies];]

[(h) Developing a reference framework for better coordination of energy-related activities within the United Nations system].

Transport

40. **(Agreed)** The transport sector and mobility in general have an essential and positive role to play in economic and social development, and transportation needs will undoubtedly increase. Over the next 20 years, transportation is expected to be the major driving force behind a growing world demand for energy. The transport sector is the largest end-user of energy in developed countries and the fastest growing one in most developing countries. Current patterns of transportation with their dominant patterns of energy use are not sustainable and on present trends may compound the environmental problems the world is facing and the health impacts referred to in paragraph 25 above. There is a need for:

(a) **(Agreed)** The promotion of integrated transport policies that consider alternative approaches to meeting commercial and private mobility needs and improve performance in the transport sector at the national, regional and global levels, and particularly a need to encourage international cooperation in the transfer of environmentally sound technologies in the transport sector and implementation of appropriate training programmes in accordance with national programmes and priorities;

(b) **(Agreed)** The integration of land use and urban, peri-urban and rural transport planning, taking into account the need to protect ecosystems;

(c) **(Agreed)** The adoption and promotion, as appropriate, of measures to mitigate the negative impact of transportation on the environment, including measures to improve efficiency in the transportation sector;

(d) **(Agreed)** The use of a broad spectrum of policy instruments to improve energy efficiency and efficiency standards in transportation and related sectors;

[(e) An initiative to prepare, at the international level, a tax on aviation fuel;]

[(f) Accelerating the phasing-out of the use of leaded gasoline as soon as possible, in pursuit of the objectives of reducing the severe health impacts of human exposure to lead, as stated in chapter I, paragraph 169, of the report of the Commission on Sustainable Development on its second session, in 1994,[17] and to that end explore ways in which developing countries might be given technological and economic assistance to make the necessary transition;]

[(g) The promotion of guidelines for environmentally friendly transport, and actions for reducing vehicle emissions of carbon dioxide, carbon monoxide, particulate matter and volatile organic compounds, as soon as possible, preferably within the next 10 years;]

/...

(h) **(Agreed)** Partnerships at the national level, involving Governments, local authorities, non-governmental organizations and the private sector, for strengthening transport infrastructures and developing innovative mass transport schemes.

Atmosphere

41. Ensuring that the global climate and atmosphere is not further damaged with irreversible consequences for future generations requires political will and concerted efforts by the international community in accordance with the principles enshrined in the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. Under the Convention, some first steps have been taken to deal with the global problem of climate change. Despite the adoption of the Convention, the emission and concentration of greenhouse gases (GHGs) continue to rise, even as scientific evidence assembled by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) and other relevant bodies continues to diminish the uncertainties and points ever more strongly to the severe risk of global climate change. **[So far, insufficient progress has been made by developed countries in meeting their [aim to return GHG emissions to 1990 levels by the year 2000]]**. It is recognized in the Berlin Mandate[18] that the **[commitments under article 4, paragraph 2 (a) and (b) of the Convention] [Convention's commitments]** are inadequate to meet the objectives of the Convention, and therefore there is a need to strengthen these commitments. It is most important that the Conference of Parties to the Convention, at its third session, to be held at Kyoto, Japan later in 1997, adopt a protocol or other legal instrument that fully encompasses the Berlin Mandate. The Geneva Ministerial Declaration[19] which was noted without formal adoption, but which received majority support among ministers and other heads of delegation attending the second session of the Conference of the Parties, also called for, inter alia, the acceleration of negotiations on the text of a legally binding protocol or other legal instrument.

[42. Member States are urged to agree on a satisfactory result of these negotiations at the third session of the Conference of the Parties, scheduled to be held at Kyoto, Japan in December 1997.]

OR

[42. At the third session of the Conference of the Parties, Member States are urged to adopt the strongest possible agreement, including legally binding budgets or targets for developed countries and to ensure maximum flexibility in reaching such budgets or targets; all countries are urged to participate in taking meaningful actions to address the problem.]

OR

[42. The Conference of the Parties, at its third session, should call upon countries of the industrialized world, reaffirming the Berlin Mandate and the Ministerial Declaration of the Conference of the Parties at its second session, to agree on quantified, legally-binding objectives for emission limitation and significant overall reduction of GHGs within specified time-frames, such as 2005, 2010 and 2020, with respect to their anthropogenic emissions by source and

/...

to the removal by sinks of GHGs not controlled by the Montreal Protocol, and to agree to elaborate policies and measures.]

OR

[42. At the third session of the Conference of the Parties, a legally binding commitment for a 15 per cent reduction in the emissions of CO_2, CH_4 and N_2O, combined, to below the 1990 level by the year 2010 must be agreed upon, as well as mandatory and recommended policies and measures, including harmonized ones, to ensure that this target is achieved.]

OR

[42. At its third session, the Conference of the Parties should call upon the industrialized world to agree on a legally binding commitment for a 20 per cent reduction of the emissions of CO_2 to below the 1990 level by the year 2005. Other greenhouse gas emissions will also be covered by this instrument as well as coordinated policies and measures to ensure that this target is achieved.]

43. **(Agreed)** International cooperation in the implementation of chapter 9 of Agenda 21, in particular in the transfer of technology to and capacity-building in developing countries, is also essential to promote the effective implementation of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change.

44. **(Agreed)** There is also a need to strengthen systematic observational networks to identify the possible onset and distribution of climate change and assess potential impacts, particularly at the regional level.

45. **(Agreed)** The ozone layer continues to be severely depleted and the Montreal Protocol[20] needs to be strengthened. The Copenhagen Amendment to the Protocol needs to be ratified. The recent successful conclusion of the replenishment negotiations of the Montreal Protocol Multilateral Fund is welcomed. This has made available funds for, among other things, earlier phase-out of ozone-depleting substances, including methyl bromide, in developing countries. Future replenishment should also be adequate to ensure timely implementation of the Montreal Protocol. An increased focus on capacity-building programmes in developing countries within multilateral funds is also needed, as well as the implementation of effective measures against illegal trade in ozone-depleting substances.

46. **(Agreed)** Rising levels of transboundary air pollution should be countered, including through appropriate regional cooperation to reduce pollution levels.

Toxic chemicals

47. **(Agreed)** The sound management of chemicals is essential to sustainable development and is a fundamental underpinning human health and environmental protection. All those responsible for chemicals, throughout their life cycle, bear the responsibility for achieving this. Substantial progress on the sound management of chemicals has been made since UNCED, in particular through the establishment of the Intergovernmental Forum on Chemical Safety (IFCS) and the Inter-Organizational Programme for the Sound Management of Chemicals (IOMC). In

/...

addition, domestic regulations have been complemented by the Code of Ethics on the International Trade in Chemicals and by voluntary industry initiatives, such as Responsible Care. Despite substantial progress, a number of chemicals continue to pose significant threats to local, regional and global ecosystems and to human health. Since UNCED, there has been an increased understanding of the serious damage that certain toxic chemicals can cause to human health and the environment. Much remains to be done and the environmentally sound management of chemicals should continue to be an important issue well beyond 2000. Particular attention should also be given to cooperation in the development and transfer of technology of safe substitutes and in the development of capacity for the production of such substitutes. The decision on the sound management of chemicals adopted by the Governing Council of UNEP at its nineteenth session should be implemented in accordance with the agreed timetables for negotiations on the prior informed consent (PIC) and persistent organic pollutants (POPs) conventions. It is noted that inorganic chemicals possess roles and behaviour that are distinct from organic chemicals.

Hazardous wastes

48. **(Agreed)** Substantial progress has been made with the implementation of the Basel Convention,[21] the Bamako Convention,[22] the Fourth Lomé Convention and other regional Conventions, although more remains to be done. There are important initiatives aimed at promoting the environmentally sound management of hazardous wastes under the Basel Convention, including (a) activities undertaken to prevent illegal traffic in hazardous wastes; (b) the establishment of regional centres for training and technology transfer regarding hazardous waste minimization and management; and (c) the treatment and disposal of hazardous wastes as close as possible to their source of origin. These initiatives should be further developed. It is also important and urgent that work under the Basel Convention be completed to define which hazardous wastes are controlled under the Convention and to negotiate, adopt and implement a protocol on liability and compensation for damage resulting from transboundary movements and disposal of hazardous wastes. Land contaminated by the disposal of hazardous wastes needs to be identified and remedial actions put in hand. Integrated management solutions are also required to minimize urban and industrial waste generation and to promote recycling and reuse.

Radioactive wastes*

49. Radioactive wastes can have very serious environmental and human health impacts over long periods of time. It is essential that they are managed in a safe and responsible way. Each country has a responsibility to ensure that radioactive wastes which fall within its jurisdiction are managed properly in accordance with internationally accepted principles. The international community should make all efforts to prohibit the export of radioactive wastes to those countries that do not have appropriate waste treatment and storage facilities. The storage, transportation, transboundary movement and disposal of radioactive wastes should be guided by the principles of the Rio Declaration

---

* The Russian Federation reserved its position on this section, and wished that fact to be recorded in the final report of the session.

[, with particular attention to principles 2 and 19, and the principle that States should pursue the storage and disposal of radioactive wastes in the State in which they are generated,] [Governments shall also continue to undertake disposal activities in accordance with the proximity principle. Where such activities are likely to have a significant adverse transboundary environmental effect, States shall provide prior notification and relevant information and consult, at an early stage, with States that could be impacted by such activities] and Agenda 21 and undertaken in a manner consistent with the provisions of internationally accepted standards as well as international and relevant regional conventions. It is important to intensify efforts to promote safety measures with regard to nuclear wastes. Storage or disposal of radioactive waste should not take place near the marine environment **[and other sensitive ecological areas]** unless States determine that scientific evidence, consistent with the applicable internationally agreed principles and guidelines, shows that this does not pose an unacceptable risk to people and the environment. In the process of consideration of that evidence, appropriate application of the precautionary approach principle should be made. Further action is needed by the international community to address the need for enhancing awareness of the importance of safe management of radioactive wastes, and to ensure the prevention of incidents and accidents involving the uncontrolled release of such wastes.

50.* **(Agreed)** One of the main recommendations of Agenda 21 and of the Commission on Sustainable Development at its second session in this area was to support the ongoing efforts of the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA), the International Maritime Organization (IMO) and other relevant international organizations. The Joint Convention on the Safety of Spent Fuel Management and on the Safety of Radioactive Waste Management currently being negotiated under the auspices of IAEA is now close to completion. It will provide a comprehensive codification of international law and a guide to best practices in this area. It will rightly be based on all the principles of best practice for this subject that have evolved in the international community, including the principle that, in general, it is best for radioactive wastes to be disposed of in the State in which they were generated as far as is compatible with the safety of the management of such material. Governments should finalize this text and are urged to ratify and implement it as soon as possible so as to further improve practice and strengthen safety in this area. Transportation of irradiated nuclear fuel (INF) and high-level waste by sea should be guided by the INF Code, which should be considered for development into a mandatory instrument. The issue of potential transboundary environmental effects of activities related to the management[23] of radioactive wastes and the question of prior notification, relevant information and consultation with States that could potentially be affected by such effects, should be further addressed within the appropriate forums.

51. Increased global and regional cooperation, including exchange of information and experience and transfer of appropriate technologies, is needed to improve the management of radioactive wastes. There is a need to support the

---

* Ukraine reserved its position on this paragraph, and wished that fact to be recorded in the final report of the session.

clean-up of sites contaminated as a result of **[military activities using nuclear materials and as a result of uranium mining and other]** nuclear activities. Technical assistance should be provided to developing countries to enable them to develop or improve procedures for the management and safe disposal of radioactive wastes deriving from the use of radionuclides in medicine, research and industry **[recognizing the special needs of small island developing States and coastal States relating to the risk of environmental impact from those activities]**.

Land and sustainable agriculture

52. Land degradation and soil loss threaten the livelihood of millions of people and future food security, with implications for water resources and the conservation of biodiversity. There is an urgent need to define ways to combat or reverse the worldwide accelerating trend of soil degradation, using an ecosystem approach, taking into account the needs of populations living in mountain ecosystems and recognizing the multiple functions of agriculture. The greatest challenge for humanity is to protect and sustainably manage the natural resource base on which food and fibre production depend, while feeding and housing a population that is still growing. The international community has recognized the need for an integrated approach to the protection and sustainable management of land and soil resources, as stated in decision III/11 of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity,[24] including identification of land degradation, which involves all interested parties at the local as well as the national level, including farmers, small-scale food producers, indigenous people**[s]**, non-governmental organizations and, in particular, women, who have a vital role in rural communities. This should include action to ensure secure land tenure and access to land, credits and training as well as the removal of obstacles that inhibit farmers, especially small-scale farmers and peasants, from investing in and improving their lands and farms.

53. It remains essential to continue efforts for the eradication of poverty through, inter alia, capacity-building to reinforce local food systems, improving food security and providing adequate nutrition for the more than 800 million undernourished people in the world, located mainly in developing countries. Governments should formulate policies that promote sustainable agriculture as well as productivity and profitability. Comprehensive rural policies are required to improve access to land, combat poverty, create employment and reduce rural emigration. **[At the same time, sustainable food security among both the urban and the rural poor should be a policy priority.] [Developed countries and the international community should provide adequate resources and technical assistance to developing countries to this end.]** To meet those objectives, Governments should attach high priority to implementing the commitments of the Rome Declaration on World Food Security and World Food Summit Plan of Action, as adopted by the World Food Summit (Rome, 13-17 November 1996),[25] especially the call for a minimum target of halving the number of undernourished people in the world by the year 2015. Governments and international organizations are encouraged to implement the Global Plan of Action for the Conservation and Sustainable Utilization of Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture as adopted by the International Technical Conference on Plant Genetic Resources (Leipzig, Germany, 17-23 June 1996). **[At**

/...

the sixth session of the Commission on Sustainable Development, in 1998, the issues of sustainable agriculture and land use should be considered in relation to freshwater.] The challenge for agricultural research is to increase yields on all farmlands while protecting and conserving the natural resource base. The international community and Governments must continue or increase investments in agricultural research because it can take years or decades to develop new lines of research and bring those research findings into sustainable practice on the land. Developing countries, particularly those with high population densities, will need international cooperation to gain access to the results of such research and to technology aimed at improving agricultural productivity in limited spaces. More generally, international cooperation continues to be needed to assist developing countries in many other aspects of basic requirements of agriculture. **[There is also a need to continue work in the World Trade Organization to liberalize international trade in agriculture and to pursue food and overall trade policies that will encourage producers and consumers to utilize available resources in an economically sound and sustainable manner, taking account of the special and differential treatment for developing countries, particularly the least developed countries, and net food importers.] OR [There is also a need for further empirical work and analysis in discussions on the benefits of removing trade restrictions.] OR [There is a need to implement effectively the agricultural agreement of the World Trade Organization.]**

Desertification and drought

54. **(Agreed)** Governments are urged to conclude - by signing and ratifying, accepting, approving and/or acceding to - and to implement the United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification in Those Countries Experiencing Serious Drought and/or Desertification, Particularly in Africa, which entered into force on 26 December 1996, as soon as possible, and to support and actively participate in the first session of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention, which will be held in Rome in September 1997.

55. The international community is urged to recognize the importance and necessity of international cooperation and partnership in combating desertification and mitigating the effects of drought. **[The international community, in particular developed countries, should also therefore support the global mechanism that would indeed have the capacity to increase the effectiveness and efficiency of and ensure new and additional financial resources for advancing the implementation of the Convention and its annexes, and to contribute to the eradication of poverty, which is one of the principal consequences of desertification and drought in the majority of affected countries.] OR [The international community, in particular developed countries, should also support the global mechanism in its work to facilitate the mobilization of adequate financial resources for advancing the implementation of the Convention and its regional annexes.] [The transfer of environmentally sound, economically viable and socially acceptable technologies to developing countries relevant to combating desertification and/or mitigating the effects of drought, with a view to contributing to the achievement of sustainable development in affected areas, should be undertaken without delay.]**

Biodiversity

56. **(Agreed)** There remains an urgent need for the conservation and sustainable use of biological diversity and the fair and equitable sharing of benefits arising from the utilization of components of genetic resources. The threat to biodiversity stems mainly from habitat destruction, over-harvesting, pollution and the inappropriate introduction of foreign plants and animals. There is an urgent need for Governments and the international community, with the support of relevant international institutions, as appropriate, to:

(a) **(Agreed)** Take decisive action to conserve and maintain genes, species and ecosystems with a view to promoting sustainable management of biological diversity;

(b) **(Agreed)** Ratify the Convention on Biological Diversity and implement it fully and effectively together with the decisions of the Conference of the Parties, including recommendations on agricultural biological diversity and the Jakarta Mandate on Marine and Coastal Biological Diversity, and pursue urgently other tasks identified by the Conference of the Parties at its third meeting under the work programme on terrestrial biological diversity,[26] within the context of the ecosystems approach adopted in the Convention;

(c) **(Agreed)** Undertake concrete actions for the fair and equitable sharing of the benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources, consistent with the provisions of the Convention and the decisions of the Conference of the Parties on, inter alia, access to genetic resources and handling of biotechnology and its benefits;

(d) **(Agreed)** Pay further attention to the provision of new and additional financial resources for the implementation of the Convention;

(e) **(Agreed)** Facilitate the transfer of technologies, including biotechnology, to developing countries, consistent with the provisions of the Convention;

(f) **(Agreed)** Respect, preserve and maintain knowledge, innovations and practices of indigenous and local communities embodying traditional lifestyles, and encourage equitable sharing of the benefits arising from traditional knowledge so that those communities are adequately protected and rewarded, consistent with the provisions of the Convention on Biological Diversity and in accordance with the decisions of the Conference of the Parties;

(g) **(Agreed)** Complete rapidly the biosafety protocol under the Convention on Biological Diversity, on the understanding that the UNEP International Technical Guidelines for Safety in Biotechnology may be used as an interim mechanism during its development, and to complement it after its conclusion, including the recommendations on capacity-building related to biosafety;

(h) **(Agreed)** Stress the importance of the establishment of a clearing-house mechanism by Parties consistent with the provisions of the Convention;

(i) **(Agreed)** Recognize the role of women in the conservation of biological diversity and the sustainable use of biological resources;

(j) **(Agreed)** Provide the necessary support to integrate the conservation of biological diversity and the sustainable use of biological resources into national development plans;

(k) **(Agreed)** Promote international cooperation to develop and strengthen national capacity-building, including human resource development and institution-building;

(l) **(Agreed)** Provide incentive measures at the national, regional and international levels to promote the conservation and sustainable use of biological diversity, and to consider means to enhance developing countries' capabilities to compete in the emerging market for biological resources, while improving the functioning of that market.

Sustainable tourism

57. **(Agreed)** Tourism is now one of the world's largest industries and one of its fastest growing economic sectors. The expected growth in the tourism sector and the increasing reliance of many developing countries, including small island developing States, on this sector as a major employer and contributor to local, national, subregional and regional economies highlights the need for special attention to the relationship between environmental conservation and protection and sustainable tourism. In this regard, efforts of developing countries to broaden the traditional concept of tourism to include cultural and eco-tourism merit special consideration and the assistance of the international community, including the international financial institutions.

58. **(Agreed)** There is a need to consider further the importance of tourism in the context of Agenda 21. Tourism, like other sectors, uses resources and generates wastes, and creates environmental, cultural and social costs and benefits in the process. For sustainable patterns of consumption and production in the tourism sector, it is essential to strengthen national policy development and enhance capacity in the areas of physical planning, impact assessment, and the use of economic and regulatory instruments, as well as in the areas of information, education and marketing. A particular concern is the degradation of biodiversity and fragile ecosystems, such as coral reefs, mountains, coastal areas and wetlands.

59. **(Agreed)** Policy development and implementation should take place in cooperation with all interested parties, especially the private sector and local and indigenous communities. The Commission should develop an action-oriented international programme of work on sustainable tourism, to be defined in cooperation with the World Tourism Organization, UNCTAD, UNEP, the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity and other relevant bodies.

60. **(Agreed)** The sustainable development of tourism is of importance for all countries, in particular for small island developing States. International cooperation is needed to facilitate tourism development in developing countries - including the development and marketing of ecotourism, bearing in

mind the importance of the conservation policies required to secure long-term benefits from development in this sector - in particular in small island developing States, in the context of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States.

Small island developing States

61. **(Agreed)** The international community reaffirms its commitment to the implementation of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States. The Commission on Sustainable Development carried out a mid-term review of selected programme areas of the Programme of Action at its fourth session, in 1996. In 1998, at its sixth session, the Commission will undertake a review of all the outstanding chapters and issues of the Programme of Action. A full and comprehensive review of the Programme of Action, consistent with the review of other United Nations global conferences is scheduled for 1999. The Commission, at its fifth session, adopted a decision on modalities for the full review of the Programme of Action, including the holding of a two-day special session of the General Assembly immediately preceding the fifty-fourth session of the Assembly for an in-depth assessment and appraisal of the implementation of the Programme of Action. The full implementation of the decision would represent a significant contribution to achieving the objectives of the Global Conference for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States.

62. **(Agreed)** Considerable efforts are being made at the national and regional levels to implement the Programme of Action. These efforts need to be supplemented by effective financial support from the international community. External assistance for building the requisite infrastructure and for national capacity-building, including human and institutional capacity, and for facilitating access to information on sustainable development practices and transfer of environmentally sound technologies in accordance with paragraph 34.14 (b) of Agenda 21 is crucial for small island developing States to effectively attain the goals of the Programme of Action. To assist national capacity building, the small island developing States information network and small island developing States technical assistance programme should be operationalized as soon as possible, with support to existing regional and subregional institutions.

Natural disasters

63. **(Agreed)** Natural disasters have disproportionate consequences for developing countries, in particular small island developing States and countries with extremely fragile ecosystems. Programmes for sustainable development should give higher priority to implementation of the commitments made at the World Conference on Natural Disaster Reduction (Yokohama, Japan, 23-27 May 1994) (see A/CONF.172/9 and Add.1). There is a particular need for capacity-building for disaster planning and management and for the promotion and facilitation of the transfer of early-warning technologies to countries prone to disasters, in particular developing countries and countries with economies in transition.

64. **(Agreed)** Acknowledging that further work is needed throughout the world, there is a special need to provide developing countries with further assistance in:

(a) **(Agreed)** Strengthening mechanisms and policies designed to reduce the effects of natural disasters, improve preparedness and integrate natural disaster considerations in development planning, through, inter alia, access to resources for disaster mitigation and preparedness, response and recovery;

(b) **(Agreed)** Improving access to relevant technology and training in hazard and risk assessment and early warning systems, and in protection from environmental disasters, consistent with national, subregional and regional strategies;

(c) **(Agreed)** Providing and facilitating technical, scientific and financial support for disaster preparedness and response in the context of the International Decade for Natural Disaster Reduction.

[Technological and man-made disasters]

OR

[Similar disasters with an adverse impact on the environment]

65. **[Technological and man-made disasters] [Similar disasters with an adverse impact on the environment]** become a substantial obstacle in the way of achieving the goals of sustainable development in many countries. The international community should intensify cooperation in the prevention and reduction of **[technological and man-made disasters] [similar disasters with an adverse impact on the environment]** and in disaster relief and post-disaster rehabilitation in order to enhance the capabilities of affected countries to cope with such situations.

3. Means of implementation

Financial resources and mechanisms

66. Financial resources and mechanisms play a key role in the implementation of Agenda 21. In general, the financing for the implementation of Agenda 21 will come from a country's own public and private sectors. For developing countries, ODA is a main source of external funding, and substantial new and additional funding for sustainable development and implementation of Agenda 21 will be required. Hence, all financial commitments **[and objectives]** of Agenda 21, particularly those contained in chapter 33, and **[including those] [the objectives]** related to the provision of new and additional resources that are both adequate and predictable, need to be urgently fulfilled. Renewed efforts are essential to ensure that all sources of funding contribute to economic growth, social development and environmental protection in the context of sustainable development and the implementation of Agenda 21.

67. **[For developing countries, particularly those in Africa and the least developed countries, ODA remains a main source of external funding and is essential for the prompt [full] and effective implementation of Agenda 21. [At this stage,] ODA cannot generally be replaced by private capital flows.]** Developed countries should therefore fulfil the commitments undertaken to reach the accepted United Nations target of 0.7 per cent of GNP as soon as possible. In this context the present downward trend in the ratio of ODA to GNP causes concern. Intensified efforts should be made to reverse this trend, taking into account the need for improving the quality and effectiveness of ODA. In the spirit of global partnership, the underlying factors that have led to this decrease should be addressed by all countries. Strategies should be worked out for increasing donor support to aid programmes and revitalizing the commitments that donors made at UNCED. Some countries already meet or exceed the 0.7 per cent agreed target. Official financial flows to developing countries, particularly least developed countries, remain an essential element of the partnership embodied in Agenda 21. ODA plays a significant role, inter alia, in capacity-building, infrastructure, combating poverty and environmental protection in developing countries, and a crucial role in the least developed countries. **[Official financial flows [ODA] may also play an important catalytic role in encouraging, where appropriate, country-driven policy reform efforts [and leveraging private investment]].**

68. **(Agreed)** Funding by multilateral financial institutions through their concessional mechanisms is also essential to developing countries in their efforts to fully implement the sustainable development objectives contained in Agenda 21. Such institutions should continue to respond to the development needs and priorities of developing countries. Developed countries should urgently meet their commitments under the eleventh replenishment of the International Development Association (IDA).

69.* **(Agreed)** Continued and full donor commitments to adequate, sustained and predictable funding for GEF operations is important for developing countries so that global environmental benefits can be further achieved. Donor countries are urged to engage in providing new and additional resources, with a view to equitable burden-sharing, through a satisfactory replenishment of GEF, which makes available grant and concessional funding designed to achieve global environmental benefits, thereby promoting sustainable development. Consideration should be given to further exploring the flexibility of the existing mandate of GEF in supporting activities to achieve global environmental benefits. With regard to the project cycle, further efforts should be made to continue streamlining the decision-making process in order to maintain an effective and efficient, as well as transparent, participatory and democratic framework. GEF, when acting as the operating entity of the financial mechanism of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Convention on Biological Diversity, should continue to operate in conformity with those Conventions and promote their implementation. The GEF implementing agencies, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), UNEP and the World Bank, should strengthen, as appropriate and in accordance with their respective mandates, their cooperation at all levels, including the field level.

[70. There is also a need for the effective use of an increased level of resources of United Nations funds and programmes in order to support the efforts of developing countries in implementing Agenda 21. Regional and subregional organizations with designated roles should also be strengthened to enable them to effectively support their efforts.] [There is a need for a substantial increase in resources for operational activities for development on a predictable, continuous and assured basis, commensurate with the increasing needs of developing countries (General Assembly resolution 50/120, para. 9).]

71. **(Agreed)** Private capital is a major tool of economic growth in a growing number of developing countries. Higher levels of foreign private investment should be mobilized given its mounting importance. To stimulate higher levels of private investment, Governments should aim at ensuring macroeconomic stability, open trade and investment policies, and well-functioning legal and financial systems. Further studies should be undertaken, including studies on the design of an appropriate environment, at both the national and international levels, for facilitating foreign private investment, in particular foreign direct investment (FDI) flows to developing countries, and enhancing its contribution to sustainable development. To ensure that such investments are supportive of sustainable development objectives, it is essential that the national Governments of both investor and recipient countries provide appropriate regulatory frameworks and incentives for private investment. Therefore further work should be undertaken on the design of appropriate policies and measures aimed at promoting long-term investment flows to developing countries in activities which increase their productive capability, and reducing the volatility of these flows. ODA donors and multilateral development banks are encouraged to strengthen their commitments to supporting

---

* The Philippines reserved its position on this paragraph, and wished that fact to be recorded in the final report of the session.

investment in developing countries in a manner that jointly promotes economic growth, social development and environmental protection.

72. **(Agreed)** The external debt problem continues to hamper the efforts of developing countries to achieve sustainable development. To resolve the remaining debt problems of the heavily indebted poor countries, creditor and debtor countries and international financial institutions should continue their efforts to find effective, equitable, development-oriented and durable solutions to the debt problem, including debt relief in the form of debt rescheduling, debt reduction, debt swaps and, as appropriate, debt cancellation, as well as grants and concessional flows that will help restore creditworthiness. The joint World Bank/International Monetary Fund (IMF) Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Debt Initiative supported by the Paris Club creditor countries is an important development to reduce the multilateral debt problem. Implementation of the HIPC Debt Initiative requires additional financial resources from both bilateral and multilateral creditors without affecting the support required for the development activities of developing countries.

73. There is a need for a fuller understanding of the impact of indebtedness on the pursuit of sustainable development by developing countries. **[To this end, the World Bank and IMF [should] [could] collaborate with UNCTAD and the United Nations Secretariat in further considering the interrelationship between indebtedness and sustainable development for developing countries.]**

[74. [In general,] financing for the implementation of Agenda 21 will come from countries' own public and private sectors. Policies for promoting domestic resource mobilization, including credit, could include sound macroeconomic reforms, including fiscal and monetary policy reforms, review and reform of existing subsidies, and the promotion of personal savings and access to credit, especially micro-credit, in particular for women. Such policies should be decided by each country, taking into account its own characteristics and capabilities and different levels of development, especially as reflected in national sustainable development strategies, where they exist.]

75. There is a need for making existing subsidies more transparent in order to increase public awareness of their actual economic, social and environmental impact and to reform or, where pertinent, remove them. Further national and international research in that area should be promoted in order to assist Governments in identifying and considering phasing-out subsidies that have market distorting, and socially and environmentally damaging impacts. **[Bearing in mind the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities,]** subsidy reductions should take full account of the specific conditions of individual countries and should consider potentially regressive impacts. In addition, it would be desirable to use international cooperation and coordination to promote the reduction of subsidies where these have important implications for competitiveness.

76. In order to reduce the barriers to the expanded use of economic instruments, Governments and international organizations should collect and share information on the use of economic instruments and introduce pilot schemes that would, inter alia, demonstrate how to make the best use of such instruments while seeking to avoid any adverse effects **[particularly on developing**

countries] [on the terms of and the trade competitiveness of developing countries]. When introducing economic instruments that raise the cost of economic activities for households and small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs), Governments should consider gradual phase-ins, public education programmes and targeted technical assistance as strategies for reducing distributional impacts. **[Various studies and practical experiences in a number of countries indicate that the use of economic instruments can generate win-win possibilities by shifting consumer and producer behaviour to more sustainable directions, while generating financial resources for sustainable development or reducing taxes elsewhere.]**

77. **(Agreed)** Innovative financial mechanisms are currently under discussion in international and national forums but have not yet fully evolved conceptually. The Secretary-General is to submit a report concerning innovative financing mechanisms to the Economic and Social Council at its substantive session of 1997. In view of the widespread interest in those mechanisms, appropriate organizations, including UNCTAD, the World Bank and IMF, are invited to consider conducting forward-looking studies of concerted action on such mechanisms and to share them with the Commission on Sustainable Development, other relevant intergovernmental organizations and non-governmental organizations. In this regard, innovative funding should complement ODA, not replace it. New initiatives for cooperative implementation of environment and development objectives under mutually beneficial incentive structures should be further explored.

[77 bis.* In the context of its future work programme, the Commission on Sustainable Development acknowledges and encourages contributions from Member States, non-governmental organizations and business, and United Nations bodies and other intergovernmental organizations. In particular, the recommendations of the Fourth Expert Group Meeting on Financial Issues of Agenda 21, hosted by the Government of Chile in January 1997, represent an important basis for the follow-up work in the Commission. Recognizing the important work of such expert group meetings, member countries and relevant international organizations are invited to support the convening of such meetings in the future with a view to providing further recommendations and input to the Commission, in particular at its session in the year 2000.]

OR

[77 bis. An appropriate intergovernmental process should be established to (i) consider practical policy responses to the recommendations of the expert group meetings on financial issues of Agenda 21; (ii) articulate possible strategies for implementation; and (iii) clarify the roles of ODA, public and private investment and innovative financing mechanisms in sustainable**

*** This paragraph was not negotiated, but was included at the request of Norway.**

**** This amendment to the paragraph included at the request of Norway was not negotiated, but was included at the request of the United States of America.**

development. The process should report to the Commission on Sustainable Development at its session in the year 2000.]

Transfer of environmentally sound technologies

78. The availability of scientific and technological information and access to and transfer of environmentally sound technologies are essential requirements for sustainable development. There is an urgent need for developing countries to acquire greater access to environmentally sound technologies if they are to meet the obligations agreed at UNCED and in the relevant international conventions. The ability of developing countries to participate in, benefit from and contribute to rapid advances in science and technology can significantly influence their development. This calls for the urgent fulfilment of all the **[commitments] [objectives]** contained in chapter 34 of Agenda 21. The international community should promote, facilitate and finance, as appropriate, access to and transfer of environmentally sound technologies and corresponding know-how, in particular to developing countries, on favourable terms, including concessional and preferential terms, as mutually agreed, taking into account the need to protect intellectual property rights as well as the special needs of developing countries for the implementation of Agenda 21. Current forms of cooperation involving the public and private sectors of developing and developed countries should be built upon and expanded. In this context, it is important to identify barriers and restrictions to the transfer of publicly and privately owned environmentally sound technologies, with a view to reducing such constraints while creating specific incentives, fiscal and otherwise, for the transfer of such technologies. The progress of **[commitments] [objectives]** contained in Agenda 21, in this regard, should be regularly reviewed as part of the multi-year work programme of the Commission on Sustainable Development.

79. Technology transfer and the development of the human and institutional capacity to adapt, absorb and disseminate technologies, as well as to generate technical knowledge and innovations, are part of the same process and must be given equal importance. **[Considering that technology transfer to developing countries cannot be confined to market forces alone, Governments have an important role to play in providing R&D institutions with incentives to promote and to contribute to the development of the institutional and human capacities for effective technology transfer, subject to the need to protect intellectual property rights.]**

80. **(Agreed)** Much of the most advanced environmentally sound technology is developed and held by the private sector. Creation of an enabling environment, on the part of both developed and developing countries, including supportive economic and fiscal measures, as well as a practical system of environmental regulations and compliance mechanisms, can help to stimulate private sector investment in and transfer of environmentally sound technology to developing countries. New ways of financial intermediation for the financing of environmentally sound technologies, such as "green credit lines", should be examined. Further efforts should be made by Governments and international development institutions to facilitate the transfer of privately owned technology on concessional terms, as mutually agreed, to developing countries, especially least developed countries.

/...

81. **(Agreed)** A proportion of technology is held or owned by Governments and public institutions or results from publicly funded research and development activities. The Government's control and influence over the technological knowledge produced in publicly funded research and development institutions open up the potential for the generation of publicly owned technologies that could be made accessible to developing countries, and could be an important means for Governments to catalyse private sector technology transfer. Proposals for further study of the options with respect to those technologies and publicly funded research and development activities are to be welcomed.

82. **(Agreed)** Governments should create a legal and policy framework that is conducive to technology-related private sector investments and long-term sustainable development objectives. Governments and international development institutions should continue to play a key role in establishing public-private partnerships, within and between developed and developing countries and countries with economies in transition. Such partnerships are essential for linking the advantages of the private sector - access to finance and technology, managerial efficiency, entrepreneurial experience and engineering expertise - with the capacity of Governments to create a policy environment that is conducive to technology-related private sector investments and long-term sustainable development objectives.

83. **(Agreed)** The creation of centres for the transfer of technology at various levels, including the regional level, could greatly contribute to achieving the objective of transfer of environmentally sound technologies to developing countries. For this purpose, existing United Nations bodies and mechanisms, including, as appropriate, TCDC, ECDC, the Commission on Science and Technology for Development, UNCTAD, the United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), UNEP and the regional commissions, should cooperate.

84. **(Agreed)** Governments and international development institutions can also play an important role in bringing together companies from developed and developing countries and countries with economies in transition so that they can create sustainable and mutually beneficial business linkages. Incentives should be given to stimulate the building of joint ventures between small and medium-sized enterprises of developed and developing countries and countries with economies in transition, and cleaner production programmes in public and private companies should be supported.

85. **(Agreed)** Governments of developing countries should take appropriate measures to strengthen South-South cooperation for technology transfer and capacity-building. Such measures could include the networking of existing national information systems and sources on environmentally sound technologies, and the networking of national cleaner production centres, as well as the establishment of sector-specific regional centres for technology transfer and capacity-building. Interested donor countries and international organizations should further assist developing countries in those efforts through, inter alia, supporting trilateral arrangements and contributing to the United Nations Voluntary Trust Fund for South-South Cooperation.

86. **(Agreed)** Attention must also be given to technology needs assessment as a tool for Governments in identifying a portfolio for technology transfer projects

and capacity-building activities to be undertaken to facilitate and accelerate the development, adoption and dissemination of environmentally sound technologies in particular sectors of the national economy. It is also important for Governments to promote the integration of environmental technology assessment with technology needs assessment as an important tool for evaluating environmentally sound technologies and the organizational, managerial and human resource systems related to the proper use of those technologies.

87. **(Agreed)** There is a need to further explore and enhance the potential of global electronic information and telecommunication networks. This would enable countries to choose among the available technological options that are most appropriate to their needs. In this respect, the international community should assist developing countries to enhance their capacities.

Capacity-building

88. **(Agreed)** Renewed commitment and support from the international community is essential to support national efforts for capacity-building in developing countries and countries with economies in transition.

89. **(Agreed)** The United Nations Development Programme, inter alia, through its Capacity 21 programme, should give priority attention to building capacity for the elaboration of sustainable development strategies based on participatory approaches. In this context, developing countries should be assisted, particularly in the areas of the design, implementation and evaluation of programmes and projects.

90. **(Agreed)** Capacity-building efforts should pay particular attention to the needs of women in order to ensure that their skills and experience are fully used in decision-making at all levels. The special needs, culture, traditions and expertise of indigenous people must be recognized. International financial institutions should continue to give high priority to funding capacity-building for sustainable development in developing countries and countries with economies in transition. Special attention should also be given to strengthening the ability of developing countries to absorb and generate technologies. International cooperation needs to be strengthened to promote the endogenous capacity of developing countries to utilize scientific and technological developments from abroad and to adapt them to local conditions. The role of the private sector in capacity-building should be further promoted and enhanced. South-South cooperation in capacity-building should be further supported through "triangular" cooperative arrangements. Both developed and developing countries, in cooperation with relevant international institutions, need to strengthen their efforts to develop and implement strategies for more effective sharing of environmental expertise and data.

Science

91. **(Agreed)** Public and private investment in science, education and training, and research and development should be increased significantly, with emphasis on the need to ensure equal access to opportunities for girls and women.

/...

92. **(Agreed)** International consensus-building is facilitated by the availability of authoritative scientific evidence. There is a need for further scientific cooperation, especially across disciplines, in order to verify and strengthen scientific evidence and make it accessible to developing countries. This evidence is important for assessing environmental conditions and changes. Steps should also be taken by Governments, academia, and scientific institutions to improve access to scientific information related to the environment and sustainable development. Promotion of existing regional and global networks may be useful for this purpose.

93. **(Agreed)** Increasing efforts to build and strengthen scientific and technological capacity in developing countries is an extremely important objective. Multilateral and bilateral donor agencies and Governments, as well as specific funding mechanisms, should continue to enhance their support for developing countries. Attention should also be given to countries with economies in transition.

94. **(Agreed)** The international community should also actively collaborate to promote innovations in information and communication technologies for the purpose of reducing environmental impacts, inter alia, by taking user-needs based approaches to technology transfer and cooperation.

Education and awareness

95. **(Agreed)** Education increases human welfare, and is a decisive factor in enabling people to become productive and responsible members of society. A fundamental prerequisite for sustainable development is an adequately financed and effective educational system at all levels, particularly the primary and secondary levels, that is accessible to all and that augments both human capacity and well-being. The core themes of education for sustainability include lifelong learning, interdisciplinary education, partnerships, multicultural education and empowerment. Priority should be given to ensuring women's and girls' full and equal access to all levels of education and training. Special attention should also be paid to the training of teachers, youth leaders and other educators. Education should also be seen as a means of empowering youth and vulnerable and marginalized groups, including those in rural areas, through intergenerational partnerships and peer education. Even in countries with strong education systems, there is a need to reorient education, awareness and training to increase widespread public understanding, critical analysis and support for sustainable development. Education for a sustainable future should engage a wide spectrum of institutions and sectors, including but not limited to business/industry, international organizations, youth, professional organizations, non-governmental organizations, higher education, government, educators and foundations, to address the concepts and issues of sustainable development, as embodied throughout Agenda 21, and should include the preparation of sustainable development education plans and programmes, as emphasized in the Commission's work programme on the subject adopted in 1996.[27] The concept of education for a sustainable future will be further developed by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, in cooperation with others.

/...

96. **(Agreed)** It is necessary to support and strengthen universities and other academic centres in promoting cooperation among them, particularly cooperation between those of developing countries and those of developed countries.

International legal instruments and the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development

97. **(Agreed)** The implementation and application of the principles contained in the Rio Declaration on Environment and Development should be the subject of regular assessment and reporting to the Commission on Sustainable Development by the Secretariat in collaboration with UNEP, in particular.

[98. Access to information, public participation and the right of complaint are hallmarks of environmental democracy. There should be wider access to relevant court systems to pursue environmental protection. Access should be provided to effective judicial and administrative channels for individuals and groups affected so that they can challenge or seek redress from decisions and actions that are socially and environmentally harmful or violate human rights, including access to legal mechanisms to ensure that all authorities, both national and local, and other civil organizations remain accountable for their actions in accordance with their social, environmental and human rights obligations, and within national legislation.]

[99. The progressive development and codification of international law on sustainable development is advisable, thus contributing to the coordination between the Commission on Sustainable Development and bodies of the United Nations system where these tasks are being undertaken.]

Note: The text of paragraphs 100 to 107 which follows reflects the compilation of amendments but was not negotiated during the session.

100. **[Group of 77 and China**: ~~Implementation of and compliance with international treaties in the field of sustainable development~~] **[and EU/Norway:** ~~needs further improvement~~ **is an urgent priority]**. **[Norway/Japan: This work needs to be coordinated to ensure synergies in implementation and reporting requirements and to avoid duplication and overlap.] [Canada/Norway: Similarly, science-based decision-making enhances the development and implementation of multilateral environment agreements.] [USA:** ~~Secure, sustained and predictable financial support, sufficient institutional capacity and human resources, and adequate access to technology may~~ **[Group of 77 and China: will]** ~~promote the implementation of international legal instruments.~~ **Adequate financial support and access to technology, as well as sufficient institutional capacity and human resources, will promote implementation of international legal instruments] [USA/EU:** ~~Full implementation of international commitments can eliminate~~ **[Group of 77 and China: may reduce]** ~~potential sources of conflict, and the development of cooperative, non judicial and transparent mechanisms for implementation should be pursued.~~] **[USA: Cooperation between States, including full implementation of international commitments, can reduce potential sources of conflict between States.] [EU/Norway: By improving compliance with international obligations, implementation and compliance procedures can contribute considerably to preventing international disputes. Of overriding importance remains the need for further improvement in reporting and data-**

collection systems and the further development of compliance regimes and procedures to help and encourage States to fulfil their obligations under multilateral environmental agreements by simple, cooperative, non-judicial and transparent means. In this context, the Montevideo Programme of UNEP is welcomed.]

101. **[Norway: Cooperate to develop further international law regarding liability and compensation for victims of pollution and other environmental damage caused by activities within the jurisdiction or control of States to areas beyond national jurisdiction.]**

Information and tools to measure progress

102. The further development of cost-effective tools to collect and disseminate information for decision makers at all levels through strengthened data collection **[Canada: including gender disaggregated data]**, compilation and analysis is urgently needed. **[Peru: In this context, data collection shall be emphasized in the electronic media, particularly through large scientific and technological data centres.] [USA: It is important that the objective of data collection, compilation and analysis should progress in a strategic manner so that any gaps in data can be more efficiently addressed on a priority basis.]**

[103. Japan: In order to enhance the common awareness of global environmental issues among people around the world, and to promote their understanding and participation, an environment needs to be established in which the general public can easily access information on global environmental issues through active utilization of info-communication networks, such as the Internet. High-tech info-communications infrastructure related to the global environment, using various tools such as geographic information systems and video transmission technology, including global mapping, should be also established with the collaboration of States as well as the United Nations.]

104. [Norway: Environmental impact assessments (EIAs) are an important tool for sustainable development. EIAs must be performed and made available early enough in the planning cycle to reach decision makers in time. Where important environmental values could be at stake, decisions should not be made before complete EIAs are available. EIAs should be gradually refined and applied to any national or international investment programme.]

105. The Commission's work programme on indicators for sustainable development should result in [New Zealand: ~~an adequate~~ **a**] set of indicators, including a limited number of aggregated indicators, to be used at the national level **[Group of 77 and China: ~~by the year 2000~~ as appropriate taking into account specific national issues]**. Indicators **[EU: of sustainable development, including sector-specific ones]** should play an important role in monitoring progress towards sustainable development and in facilitating national reporting, as appropriate.

[106. Efforts should be intensified to develop indicators of sustainable development in order to give more complete and accurate information for decision-making and to contribute to the "greening" of national budgets.]

Note: Para. 107 is covered in section D (International institutional arrangements), para. 125 (b) and (c).

107. National reports on the implementation of Agenda 21 **[Australia: over a five-year-period]** have proved to be a valuable means of sharing information at the international and regional levels and, even more important, of providing a focus for the coordination of issues **[Egypt: for the use of domestic resources and transfer of international financial resources and technology]** related to sustainable development within individual countries. National **[Canada:** ~~**reporting**~~ **reports** should continue ~~and should reflect all aspects of Agenda 21, including domestic action and international commitments~~, **but with a greater emphasis on results and milestones that clearly demonstrate progress on Agenda 21 and global commitments.** ~~The reporting system could be completed by peer reviews organised at the regional level~~. **Implementation of peer reviews of national reports should be given serious consideration with a view to increasing accountability for results, progress and good practices.**]

OR [Replace the last sentence with] The reporting system could be complemented by **[Group of 77 and China:** ~~**peer reviews**~~ **exchange of information and experiences at the regional level]**, **[USA/Norway: including peer reviews]**, **[Norway: building on the positive experiences of OECD and the ECE reviews.**]

D. International institutional arrangements

108. **(Agreed)** The achievement of sustainable development requires continued support from international institutions. The institutional framework outlined in chapter 38 of Agenda 21 and determined by the General Assembly in its resolution 47/191 and other relevant resolutions, including the specific functions and roles of various organs, organizations and programmes within and outside the United Nations system, will continue to be fully relevant in the period after the special session of the General Assembly. In the light of the ongoing discussions on reform within the United Nations, international institutional arrangements in the area of sustainable development are intended to contribute to the goal of strengthening the entire United Nations system. In this context, the strengthening of the institutions for sustainable development, as well as the achievement of the goals and objectives set out below would be particularly important.

1. Greater coherence in various intergovernmental organizations and processes

109. **(Agreed)** Given the increasing number of decision-making bodies concerned with various aspects of sustainable development, including international conventions, there is an ever greater need for better policy coordination at the intergovernmental level, as well as for continued and more concerted efforts to enhance collaboration among the secretariats of those decision-making bodies. Under the guidance of the General Assembly, the Economic and Social Council should play a strengthened role in coordinating the activities of the United Nations system in the economic, social and related fields.

110. **(Agreed)** The conferences of the parties to conventions signed at the Rio Conference or as a result of it, as well as other conventions related to sustainable development, should cooperate in exploring ways and means of collaborating in their work to advance the effective implementation of the conventions. There is also a need for environmental conventions to continue to pursue sustainable development objectives consistent with their provisions and be fully responsive to Agenda 21. To this end, inter alia, the conferences of the parties or governing bodies of the conventions signed at the Rio Conference, or as a result of it and of other relevant conventions and agreements should, if appropriate, give consideration to the co-location of secretariats, to improving the scheduling of meetings, to integrating national reporting requirements, to improving the balance between sessions of the conferences of the parties and sessions of their subsidiary bodies, and to encouraging and facilitating the participation of Governments in those sessions, at an appropriate level.

111. **(Agreed)** Institutional arrangements for the convention secretariats should provide effective support and efficient services, while ensuring that in order for them to be efficient, at their respective locations, appropriate autonomy is necessary. At the international and national levels there is a need for, inter alia, better scientific assessment of ecological linkages between the conventions; identification of programmes that have multiple benefits; and enhanced public awareness-raising for the conventions. Such tasks should be undertaken by UNEP in accordance with the relevant decisions of its Governing Council and in full cooperation with the conferences of the parties to and governing bodies of relevant conventions. Efforts of convention secretariats, in response to requests from the respective conferences of the parties, to explore, where appropriate, modalities for suitable liaison arrangements in Geneva and/or New York for the purpose of enhancing linkages with delegations and organizations at those United Nations centres are welcomed and fully supported.

112. (**Agreed**) It is necessary to strengthen the ACC Inter-Agency Committee on Sustainable Development and its system of task managers, with a view to further enhancing system-wide intersectoral cooperation and coordination for the implementation of Agenda 21 and for the promotion of coordinated follow-up to the major United Nations conferences in the area of sustainable development.

113. **(Agreed)** The Commission on Sustainable Development should promote increased regional implementation of Agenda 21 in cooperation with relevant regional and subregional organizations and the United Nations regional commissions, in accordance with the results of their priority-setting efforts, with a view to enhancing the role such bodies play in the achievement of sustainable development objectives agreed at the international level. The regional commissions could provide appropriate support, consistent with their work programmes, to regional meetings of experts related to the implementation of Agenda 21.

2. Role of relevant organizations and institutions of the United Nations system

114. **(Agreed)** In order to facilitate the national implementation of Agenda 21, all organizations and programmes of the United Nations system, within their respective areas of expertise and mandates, should strengthen, individually and jointly, the support for national efforts to implement Agenda 21 and make their efforts and actions consistent with national plans, policies and priorities of member States. Coordination of United Nations activities at the field level should be further enhanced through the resident coordinator system in full consultation with national Governments.

115. **(Agreed)** The role of UNEP, as the principal United Nations body in the field of environment, should be further enhanced. Taking into account its catalytic role, and in conformity with Agenda 21 and the Nairobi Declaration on the Role and Mandate of the United Nations Environment Programme, adopted on 7 February 1997,[28] UNEP is to be the leading global environmental authority that sets the global environmental agenda, promotes the coherent implementation of the environmental dimension of sustainable development within the United Nations system, and serves as an authoritative advocate for the global environment. In this context, the Governing Council decision of 4 April 1997 on governance and other related Governing Council decisions are relevant. The role of UNEP in the further development of international environmental law should be strengthened, including the development of coherent interlinkages among relevant environmental conventions in cooperation with their respective conferences of the parties or governing bodies. In performing its functions related to the conventions signed at the Rio Conference or as a result of it and other relevant conventions, UNEP should strive to promote the effective implementation of those conventions in a manner consistent with the provisions of the conventions and the decisions of the conferences of the parties.

116. **(Agreed)** UNEP, in the performance of its role, should focus on environmental issues, taking into account the development perspective. A revitalized UNEP should be supported by adequate, stable and predictable funding. UNEP should continue providing effective support to the Commission on Sustainable Development, inter alia, in the form of scientific, technical and policy information, analysis and advice on global environmental issues.

117. **(Agreed)** UNDP should continue to strengthen its contribution to and programmes in sustainable development and the implementation of Agenda 21 at all levels particularly in the area of promoting capacity-building (including through its Capacity 21 programme) in cooperation with other organizations, as well as in the field of poverty eradication.

118. **(Agreed)** UNCTAD, in accordance with General Assembly resolution 51/167 and relevant decisions of the Trade and Development Board on the work programme, should continue to play a key role in the implementation of Agenda 21 through the integrated examination of linkages among trade, investment, technology, finance and sustainable development.

119. **(Agreed)** The WTO Committee on Trade and Environment, UNCTAD and UNEP should advance their coordinated work on trade and environment, involving other

/...

appropriate international and regional organizations in their cooperation and coordination. In coordination with WTO, UNCTAD and UNEP should continue to support efforts to promote the integration of trade, environment and development. The Commission on Sustainable Development should continue to play its important role in the deliberations on trade and environment to facilitate the integrated consideration of all factors relevant for achieving sustainable development.

120. Implementation of the commitment of the international financial institutions to sustainable development should continue to be strengthened. The World Bank has a significant role to play, bearing in mind its expertise and the overall volume of resources that it commands. **[Adequate replenishment by the donor community of the International Development Association (IDA) is indispensable for its future work. Donor countries are urged to engage in providing new and additional resources, with a view to equitable burden-sharing, through the satisfactory replenishment of GEF, which makes available grant and concessional funding designed to achieve global environmental benefits and therefore promotes sustainable development. The designation of GEF as the permanent entity entrusted with the operation of the financial mechanisms of the United Nations Framework Convention Climate Change and the Convention on Biological Diversity, to be considered by the conferences of the parties to those conventions, is also indispensable to the future work of GEF. However, in keeping with the commitments made at UNCED, increased availability of new and additional funding for sustainable development is necessary from all sources.] [In keeping with the commitments made at UNCED, funding for Agenda 21 and other outcomes of the Conference should be provided in a way that maximizes the availability of new and additional resources and uses all available funding sources and mechanisms.]**

121. **(Agreed)** Operationalization of the global mechanism of the United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification in Those Countries Experiencing Serious Drought and/or Desertification, Particularly in Africa is also essential.

3. Future role and programme of work of the Commission on Sustainable Development

122. **(Agreed)** The Commission on Sustainable Development, within its mandate, as specified in General Assembly resolution 47/191, will continue to provide a central forum for reviewing progress and for urging further implementation of Agenda 21 and other commitments made at UNCED or as a result of it, for conducting high-level policy debate aimed at consensus-building on sustainable development and for catalysing action and long-term commitment to sustainable development at all levels. It should continue to undertake these tasks in complementing and providing interlinkages to the work of other United Nations organs, organizations and bodies acting in the field of sustainable development. The Commission has a role to play in assessing the challenges of globalization as they relate to sustainable development. The Commission should perform its functions in coordination with other subsidiary bodies of the Economic and Social Council and other related organizations and institutions, including making recommendations, within its mandate, to the Economic and Social Council, bearing in mind the interrelated outcomes of recent United Nations conferences.

123. **(Agreed)** The Commission should focus on issues that are crucial to achieving the goals of sustainable development. It should promote policies that integrate economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainability and should provide for integrated consideration of linkages, both among sectors and between sectoral and cross-sectoral aspects of Agenda 21. In this connection, the Commission should carry out its work in such a manner as to avoid unnecessary duplication and repetition of work undertaken by other relevant forums.

124. **(Agreed)** In the light of the above, it is recommended that the Commission on Sustainable Development adopt the multi-year programme of work for the period 1998-2002 contained in the annex below.

4. Methods of work of the Commission on Sustainable Development

125. **(Agreed)** Based on the experience gained during the period 1993-1997, the Commission, under the guidance of the Economic and Social Council, should:

(a) **(Agreed)** Make concerted efforts to attract greater involvement in its work of ministers and high-level national policy makers responsible for specific economic and social sectors, who, in particular, are encouraged to participate in the annual high-level segments of the Commission together with the ministers and policy makers responsible for environment and development. The high-level segments of the Commission should become more interactive, and should focus on the priority issues being considered at a particular session. The Bureau of the Commission should conduct timely and open-ended consultations with the view to improving the organization of the work of the high-level segments;

(b) **(Agreed)** Continue to provide a forum for the exchange of national experience and best practices in the area of sustainable development, including through voluntary national communications or reports. Consideration should be given to the results of ongoing work aimed at streamlining requests for national information and reporting and the results of the "pilot phase" on indicators of sustainable development. In this context, the Commission should consider more effective modalities for the further implementation of commitments made in Agenda 21, with an appropriate emphasis on means of implementation. Countries may wish to submit to the Commission, on a voluntary basis, information regarding their efforts to incorporate the relevant recommendations of other United Nations conferences in national sustainable development strategies;

(c) **(Agreed)** The Commission should take into account regional developments related to the implementation of the outcomes of UNCED. It should provide a forum for the exchange of experience on regional and subregional initiatives and regional collaboration for sustainable development. This could include the promotion of the voluntary regional exchange of national experience in the implementation of Agenda 21 and, inter alia, the possible development of modalities for reviews by and among those countries that voluntarily agree to do so, within regions. In this context, the Commission should encourage the availability of funding for the implementation of initiatives related to such reviews;

(d) (**Agreed**) Establish closer interaction with international financial, development and trade institutions, as well as with other relevant bodies within and outside the United Nations system, including the World Bank, GEF, UNDP, WTO, UNCTAD and UNEP, which, in turn, are invited to take full account of the results of policy deliberations in the Commission and to integrate them in their own work programmes and activities;

(e) **(Agreed)** Strengthen its interaction with representatives of major groups including through greater and better use of focused dialogue sessions and round tables. These groups are important resources in operationalizing, managing and promoting sustainable development and contribute to the implementation of Agenda 21. The major groups are encouraged to adopt arrangements for coordination and interaction in providing inputs to the Commission. Taking into account the Commission's programme of work, this could include inputs from:

(i) The scientific community and research institutions on greater understanding of the interactions between human activity and natural ecosystems and on how to manage global systems sustainably;

(ii) Women, children and youth, indigenous people and their communities, non-governmental organizations, local authorities, workers and their trade unions and farmers on the elaboration, promotion and sharing of effective strategies, policies, practices and processes to promote sustainable development;

(iii) Business and industry groups in the elaboration, promotion and sharing of sustainable development practices and their promotion of corporate responsibility and accountability;

(f) (**Agreed**) Organize the implementation of its next multi-year programme of work in the most effective and productive way, including through shortening its annual meeting to two weeks. The inter-sessional ad hoc working groups

/...

should help to focus the Commission's sessions by identifying key elements to be discussed and important problems to be addressed within specific items of the Commission's programme of work. Government hosted and funded expert meetings will continue to provide inputs to the work of the Commission;

126. **(Agreed)** The Secretary-General is invited to review the functioning of the High-Level Advisory Board on Sustainable Development and present proposals on ways to promote more direct interaction between the Board and the Commission, with a view to ensuring that the Board contributes to the deliberations on specific themes considered by the Commission in accordance with its programme of work.

127. **(Agreed)** The work of the Committee on New and Renewable Sources of Energy and on Energy for Development and the Committee on Natural Resources should be more compatible with and supportive of the programme of work of the Commission. The Economic and Social Council, in carrying out its functions related to the implementation of General Assembly resolution 50/227, should consider, at its substantive session of 1997, the most effective means of bringing this about.

128. **(Agreed)** Arrangements for the election of the Bureau should be changed in order to allow the same Bureau to provide guidance for the preparation for and lead work during the annual sessions of the Commission. The Commission would benefit from such a change, and the Economic and Social Council should take the necessary action at its substantive session of 1997 to ensure that these new arrangements take effect.

129. **(Agreed)** The next comprehensive review of progress achieved in the implementation of Agenda 21 by the General Assembly will take place in the year 2002. The modalities of this review should be determined at a later stage.

Notes

[1] United Nations Environment Programme, Global Environment Outlook (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1997).

[2] United Nations Environment Programme, Convention on Biological Diversity (Environmental Law and Institution Programme Activity Centre), June 1992.

[3] Report of the Global Conference on the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States, Bridgetown, Barbados, 25 April-6 June 1994 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.94.I.18 and corrigenda), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II.

[4] United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea with Index and Final Act of the Third United Nations Conference on the Law of the Sea (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.83.V.5).

[5] Report of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development, Rio de Janeiro, 3-14 June 1992, vol. I, Resolutions Adopted by the Conference (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.93.I.8 and corrigendum), resolution 1, annex I.

/...

[6] Ibid., resolution 1, annex III.

[7] Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I.

[8] Ibid., resolution 1, annex II.

[9] Report of the Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, 4-15 September 1995 (A/CONF.177/20 and Add.1), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II.

[10] Results of the Uruguay Round of Multilateral Trade Negotiations: The Legal Texts (Geneva, GATT secretariat, 1994).

[11] Adopted by the WTO Ministerial Meeting held at Singapore in December 1996.

[12] Report of the International Conference on Population and Development, Cairo, 5-13 September 1994 (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.95.XIII.18), chap. I, resolution 1, annex.

[13] See Report of the International Conference on Primary Health Care, Alma-Ata, USSR, 6-12 September 1978 (Geneva, World Health Organization, 1978).

[14] Report of the United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II), Istanbul, 3-14 June 1996 (A/CONF.165/14), chap. I, resolution 1, annexes I and II.

[15] Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1996, Supplement No. 8 (E/1996/28), chap. I, sect. C, decision 4/15, para. 45.

[16] Ibid., 1997, Supplement No. 9 (E/1997/29).

[17] Ibid., 1994, Supplement No. 13 (E/1994/33/Rev.1).

[18] Berlin Mandate: review of the adequacy of article 4, paragraph 2 (a) and (b) of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, including proposals related to a protocol and decisions on follow-up (FCCC/CP/1995/7/Add.1, sect. I, decision 1/CP.1).

[19] Report of the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change on its second session, Geneva, 8-19 July 1996 (FCCC/CP/1996/15/Add.1), annex.

[20] Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer, International Legal Materials, vol. 26, No. 6 (November 1987), p. 1550.

[21] Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and Their Disposal (UNEP/WG/190/4) (United Nations, Treaty Series, vol. 1673, No. 28911, forthcoming).

[22] Bamako Convention on the Ban of the Import into Africa of All Forms of Hazardous Wastes and the Control of their Transboundary Movements within Africa, International Legal Materials, vol. 30, No. 3 (May 1991), p. 775, and vol. 32, No. 1 (January 1992), p. 164.

[23] The management of radioactive wastes is defined as the handling, treatment, storage, transportation and final disposal of such wastes.

[24] Report of the third meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity (UNEP/CBD/COP/3/38), annex II.

[25] Report of the World Food Summit, Rome, 13-17 November 1996, Part One (WFS 96/REP) (Rome, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, 1997), appendix.

[26] Report of the third meeting of the Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity (UNEP/CBD/COP/3/38), annex II, decision III/12.

[27] See Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1996, Supplement No. 8 (E/1996/28), chap. I, sect. C, decision 4/11.

[28] Decision 19/1 of the Governing Council of the United Nations Environment Programme; reproduced in document A/S-19/5, annex, sect. I.

Annex

MULTI-YEAR PROGRAMME OF WORK FOR THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

1998 session [Overriding issues: poverty, consumption and production patterns]		
Sectoral theme:	Cross-sectoral theme:	Economic sector/major group:
[INTEGRATED FRESHWATER MANAGEMENT] Review of outstanding chapters of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States[a]	TRANSFER OF TECHNOLOGY/ CAPACITY-BUILDING/ EDUCATION/SCIENCE/ AWARENESS-RAISING	INDUSTRY
Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-8, 10-15, 18-21, 23-34, 36, 37, 40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-4, 6, 16, 23-37, 40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 4, 6, 9, 16, 17, 19-21, 23-35, 40.

1999 session [Overriding issues: poverty, consumption and production patterns]		
Comprehensive review of the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States		
Sectoral theme: OCEANS AND SEAS	Cross-sectoral theme: CONSUMPTION AND PRODUCTION PATTERNS	Economic sector: TOURISM
Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 5-7, 9, 15, 17, 19-32, 34-36, 39-40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-10, 14, 18-32, 34-36, 40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-7, 13, 15, 17, 23-33, 36.

/...

2000 session [Overriding issues: poverty, consumption and production patterns]		
Sectoral theme: INTEGRATED PLANNING AND MANAGEMENT OF LAND RESOURCES	Cross-sectoral theme: FINANCIAL RESOURCES/TRADE AND INVESTMENT/ECONOMIC GROWTH	Economic sector/major group: AGRICULTURE[b] Day of Indigenous People
Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-8, 10-37, 40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-4, 23-33, 36-38, 40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-7, 10-16, 18-21, 23-34, 37, 40.

2001 session [Overriding issues: poverty, consumption and production patterns]		
Sectoral theme: [ATMOSPHERE] [ENERGY]	Cross-sectoral theme: INFORMATION FOR DECISION-MAKING AND PARTICIPATION [International cooperation for an enabling environment]	Economic sector/major group: ENERGY; TRANSPORT
Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 4, 6-9, 11-14, 17, 23-37, 39-40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2, 4, 6, 8, 23-36, 38-40.	Main issues for an integrated discussion under the above theme: Agenda 21, chapters 2-5, 8, 9, 20, 23-37, 40.

2002 session		
Comprehensive review		

[a] The review will cover those chapters of the Programme of Action not covered during the in-depth review carried out by the Commission at its fourth session.

[b] Including forestry (pending the outcome of the discussion on forestry).

Chapter II

PREPARATIONS FOR THE SPECIAL SESSION OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY FOR THE PURPOSE OF AN OVERALL REVIEW AND APPRAISAL OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF AGENDA 21

2. The Commission on Sustainable Development considered the question of preparations for the special session (agenda item 4), together with the report of the ad hoc Intergovernmental Panel on Forests (agenda item 3), at its 2nd to 7th and 12th meetings, on 8 to 11 and 25 April 1997. The Commission held a high-level discussion on the items at its 2nd to 6th meetings, from 8 to 10 April (see E/1997/29, chap. II). (For other action taken by the Commission under agenda item 4, see E/1997/29, chap. III.)

3. The following representatives were designated to chair the drafting groups which were established to negotiate the document on the proposed outcome of the special session: Mr. Celso Luis Amorim (Brazil), Mr. Bagher Asadi (Islamic Republic of Iran), Mr. John Ashe (Antigua and Barbuda), Mr. Derek Osborn (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) and Mr. Czeslaw Wieckowski (Poland).

ACTION TAKEN BY THE COMMISSION

Proposed outcome of the special session

4. At its 12th meeting, on 25 April, the Commission considered the text of the proposed outcome of the special session, which was before it in a series of informal papers.

5. Statements were made by the chairpersons of the drafting groups on the outcome of negotiations held on their respective chapters of the document, followed by a paragraph-by-paragraph discussion.

6. At the same meeting, the Commission decided to transmit the text of the proposed outcome of the special session, as orally revised and amended during the discussion, to the special session of the General Assembly for further consideration and adoption (see chap. I, sect. B).

Draft political statement

7. At its 12th meeting, on 25 April, the Commission had before it a proposed draft political statement, subsequently issued in document E/CN.17/1997/L.12, which was drawn up by both the Chairman and the Vice-Chairperson of the Commission, Ms. Monica Linn-Locher (Switzerland).

8. Following statements by the representatives of the Netherlands (on behalf of the States Members of the United Nations that are members of the European Union), the United Republic of Tanzania (on behalf of the States Members of the United Nations that are members of the Group of 77 and China), India, Venezuela, Cuba, Nigeria and Morocco, as well as by the Chairman and Vice-Chairperson,

Ms. Linn-Locher, the Commission agreed that the text of the draft political statement would be subject to further consultations and negotiations in the context of the preparations for and during the nineteenth special session of the General Assembly (see chap. I, sect. A).

Chairman's summary of the high-level segment of the Commission

9. At the 12th meeting, on 25 April, the Commission agreed to annex the Chairman's summary of the high-level segment of the Commission, contained in document E/CN.17/1997/CRP.3, to the final report of the Commission (see annex I below).

Summary reports of the working group of the Commission

10. At the 12th meeting, on 25 April, the Commission had before it summary reports from the working group of the Commission on the dialogue sessions held with major groups (E/CN.17/1997/L.2-L.10) together with a summary report of a synthesis session (E/CN.17/1997/L.11).

11. At the same meeting, the Secretary read out agreed changes to the text. The Commission then agreed to annex the summary reports, in final form, to the report of the Commission (see annex II below).

12. The representative of the Netherlands made a statement on behalf of the States Members of the United Nations that are members of the European Union.

Annex I

CHAIRMAN'S SUMMARY OF THE HIGH-LEVEL SEGMENT OF THE FIFTH SESSION OF THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

(New York, 10 April 1997)

I. GENERAL REMARKS

Participants agreed that the proposed outcome of the 1997 special session of the General Assembly prepared by the Co-Chairmen of the Commission's Ad Hoc Inter-sessional Working Group (E/CN.17/1997/13, sect. I) provides a good basis for negotiation of the final document of the special session.

Participants at the high-level segment had an open and frank dialogue in an atmosphere of cooperation and understanding, gave political guidance for further deliberation and negotiation by the Commission at its fifth session on the text of the final document, and made a number of specific additional proposals.

Participants emphasized the need for a strong and authoritative final document to be prepared for adoption at the highest political level during the special session.

Participants stressed the need for agreement at the special session on a number of specific targets and goals, with time-frames and means for their achievement. Such targets and time-frames may be different for different groups of countries, but they should be concrete, achievable and measurable.

After 1997, the Commission should review, on a regular basis, progress towards the achievement of agreed goals and targets, the reasons for their success or failure, and means for rectifying weaknesses.

Participants emphasized that the General Assembly should give due consideration at the special session to the financing of sustainable development. In particular, there is a need to mobilize more positive approaches to the issue of the agreed official development assistance (ODA) target of 0.7 per cent of gross national product (GNP). There was general agreement, with possibly one exception, that that target should be achieved within a specific time-frame, and that some tangible intermediate steps in that direction should be taken as a sign of goodwill. At the same time, there is a need to enhance the quality and effectiveness of ODA. This could include using ODA to help provide an enabling environment and infrastructure that would attract foreign direct investment (FDI) as a means of achieving the goals of sustainable development, particularly in the least developed countries.

There was strong emphasis by developing countries on the urgent need for the creation of a climate that would enable them to increase production of goods and services and that would provide market access for such goods and services.

Another crucial issue is the transfer of cleaner and more efficient technologies. It was felt that very promising approaches to facilitating the

/...

transfer of such technologies can be devised if this issue is discussed within specific sectors and contexts. The possible impact of trade-related intellectual property rights (TRIPs) on technology transfer needs to be carefully studied.

Participants stressed that the eradication of poverty should be seen as a central goal of sustainable development. Several measures were discussed that could promote poverty alleviation. Emphasis was placed on the need to move from talking to taking action.

Participants stressed that now is the time to implement concretely all that was agreed at the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) and subsequent United Nations conferences, particularly the Fourth World Conference on Women, the World Summit for Social Development, the International Conference on Population and Development, the Global Conference on the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States, and the United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II).

Other areas of specific concern in which new commitments, specific goals and actions, and enhanced international cooperation are required include:

(a) Freshwater;

(b) Oceans, including ocean pollution and fisheries;

(c) Climate Change;

(d) Biological diversity;

(e) Energy production, distribution and use;

(f) Forests;

(g) Transport;

(h) Tourism;

(i) Land degradation, especially desertification.

The above examples do not imply any downgrading in the importance of other areas of Agenda 21; they are given simply to focus attention on a more limited number of areas in which concrete results seem to be achievable.

It was stressed that in all of these areas it would be crucial for the General Assembly at the special session not only to identify specific goals and targets but also to agree on ways and means of achieving them.

The ministers attending the high-level segment held two informal meetings, which provided a useful opportunity for direct and frank exchanges of views and

/...

ideas on the expected outcome of the special session, and on key policy issues to be addressed at the session. Such informal meetings should be encouraged.

* * *

The summary contained in section II below highlights the main ideas and proposals made during the high-level segment, which appear to be additional to those contained in the Co-Chairmen's proposed outcome. The Chairman's summary should be seen as a supplement to the Co-Chairmen's proposed outcome and not a substitute for it. The Co-Chairmen's proposed outcome will serve as the main text for negotiations at the special session.

II. SUMMARY OF POINTS RAISED DURING THE HIGH-LEVEL SEGMENT

The statements made during the Commission's high-level segment closely reflected the issues covered in the proposed outcome for the 1997 special session prepared by the Co-Chairmen of its Ad Hoc Inter-sessional Working Group (E/CN.17/1997/13, sect. I). Most statements were related to sections C and D of the proposed outcome (Implementation in areas requiring urgent action and International institutional arrangements). A number of the proposals made during the high-level segment appeared to be additional to those contained in the Co-Chairman's proposed outcome. They are listed below, following the structure of the proposed outcome (relevant headings are reproduced between quotation marks ("")); they should be read in conjunction with the proposed outcome and considered as a supplement to it.

"C. Implementation in areas requiring urgent action"

"1. Integration of economic, social and environmental objectives"

"Eradicating poverty"

1. There was wide consensus on the overwhelming priority of the need to eradicate poverty. It was proposed that:

(a) Specific time-bound targets for poverty alleviation be pursued, as agreed by the World Summit for Social Development;

(b) The 20/20 proposal for provision of basic social services be fully implemented;

(c) The United Nations Secretary-General be requested to elaborate by the year 1999, proposed strategies for world development for the first decade of the twenty-first century, integrating the results of the global conferences.

"Changing consumption and production patterns"

2. There was wide consensus on the need for more efficient use of energy and materials, with the developed countries taking the lead. It was proposed that:

(a) Countries improve the efficiency of their resource use, through implementation of the "Factor 10" initiative, which calls for a tenfold improvement in resource productivity in the long term. An interim target of a fourfold improvement in resource productivity should be established for the year 2020;

(b) Eco-efficiency be implemented through programmes for cleaner production and environmental auditing;

(c) Greater use be made of economic instruments to internalize environmental costs, with the proceeds used to reduce taxes on labour (ecological tax reform);

(d) Transnational corporations and their subsidiaries strive to obtain ISO 14000 certification by the year 2000.

"Making trade, environment and sustainable development mutually supportive"

3. Globalization and trade liberalization hold promise but may also threaten the environment. The following additional recommendations were made:

(a) The World Trade Organization (WTO) Committee on Trade and Environment should try to reconcile any differences between the trade provisions of multilateral environmental agreements with those of WTO;

(b) The WTO fund for technical assistance to least developed countries should receive deeper and wider support from donors;

(c) WTO should review the TRIPS agreement so as to facilitate the transfer to developing countries of environmentally sound technologies;

(d) Globalization should be the subject of a debate in the Commission, which and the CSD should be a forum for discussing trade and environment.

"Sustainable human settlements"

4. Global targets should be established by the Commission to promote local Agenda 21 campaigns and to deal with obstacles to local Agenda 21 initiatives.

"2. Sectors and issues"

5. The priorities of freshwater, energy, atmosphere and biodiversity were emphasized, and the additional proposals set out below were made.

"Freshwater"

6. There is a need for an international global water initiative to develop a global programme of action under the auspices of the Commission to ensure that decisive action is taken to ensure the optimal utilization and protection of water resources and the provision of adequate water supply and sanitation services within the next 10 years in all countries. To that end, effective

programmes must be developed to deal with the problem of proper treatment of municipal waste water.

7. A multilateral fund should be established to provide financial and technological support to developing countries for the sustainable use and management of freshwater resources.

"Oceans"

8. Broad support was given to the inclusion of oceans as a priority issue in the future work programme of the Commission, and to the key areas requiring urgent action indicated in the Co-Chairmen's proposed outcome, in particular areas related to overfishing and marine pollution. In addition, actions proposed included:

(a) Special priority should be given to coastal zone management, including the possible creation of a code of conduct for coastal zones;

(b) The capacity and functions of the Intergovernmental Oceanographic Commission of United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, as the coordinating entity for research and scientific monitoring of the marine environment, should be reinforced;

(c) The Commission should be confirmed as the United Nations body responsible for a coordinated approach to oceans issues;

(d) Urgent action should be taken to establish guiding principles for the sustainable management, conservation and harvesting of fish stocks, and for the integration of the environment into fisheries policies;

(e) With respect to the phasing out of subsidies to eliminate or reduce excess fishing fleet capacity, a target of up to a 50 per cent reduction over the next 5 years could be set, and the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations should be called on to play an active role in that regard.

"Forests"

9. The conservation, management and sustainable development of all types of forests is an integral part of sustainable development. Forest goods and services are essential to economic and social development and to the earth's life-supporting systems. The work of the Commission's Intergovernmental Panel on Forests was commended, and its recommendations and proposals for actions were endorsed. It was proposed that:

(a) Countries and international organizations, including the informal high-level Inter-agency Task Force on Forests, immediately implement the proposals for action contained in the report of the Panel;

(b) Effective partnerships and collaboration with all actors, including major groups, be established for the implementation of the proposals for action of the Panel;

(c) Work related to existing conventions and international organizations needs to be coordinated in order to ensure synergies in implementation and reporting requirements and avoid duplication and overlap;

(d) National, regional, subregional and international initiatives on forests, in particular those involving criteria and indicators for sustainable forest management, should be encouraged and promoted;

(e) The holistic and integrated intergovernmental dialogue on forest, as launched by the Panel, should be continued under the auspices of the Commission to monitor implementation of the Panel's recommendations and to further promote consensus on forest-related issues. Various options for institutional follow-up were discussed, including:

(i) Establishing an intergovernmental negotiating committee to negotiate a forest convention;

(ii) Establishing an intergovernmental forum under the auspices of the Commission to further develop the report of the Panel and review the need for a convention;

(iii) Continuing the dialogue on forests within existing relevant United Nations organizations.

"Energy"

10. Several speakers noted the need to elaborate a common strategy for a sustainable energy future. In the framework of such a strategy, Governments should commit themselves to developing and promoting sustainable energy policies, involving all actors. Specific proposals included:

(a) The Commission on Sustainable Development should devote one of the sessions in the near future to the establishment of such a common strategy. As a follow-up to such a session, the General Assembly should launch a decade for a global sustainable energy future;

(b) Targets should be established for energy efficiency and the share of renewable energy in the energy supply;

(c) An intergovernmental panel on sustainable energy should be established, based on the experience of the Intergovernmental Panel on Forests.

"Transport"

11. There was consensus on the economic importance of this sector and its environmental impacts. New proposals included:

(a) The special session should establish an initiative to consider, at the international level, a tax on aviation fuel;

(b) International agreement should be reached on a target date for the phase-out of the use of leaded gasoline.

"Atmosphere"

12. Many speakers stressed the need for a legally binding protocol or other instrument to be agreed at Kyoto, including emissions targets for developed nations, with maximum flexibility in reaching such targets. Some of the proposals mentioned were:

(a) A target should be set for a 15 per cent reduction of greenhouse gases below 1990 levels by the year 2010;

(b) An intermediate target should be set of 10 or 20 per cent reduction by 2005;

(c) Objectives should be realistic, achievable and equitable.

"Chemicals and wastes"

13. Many delegations stressed the urgency of the expeditious conclusion and/or implementation of major international conventions and mechanisms for the environmentally sound management of toxic chemicals and hazardous wastes. The following additional proposals were made:

(a) A broad legal instrument governing the global use and management of chemicals should be considered;

(b) More emphasis should be given to chemical safety issues, including the problem of endocrine disruptors and major chemical contamination in developing countries and economies in transition;

(c) Radioactive wastes should be stockpiled in the countries that generate such wastes. The export of radioactive wastes should be prohibited, except to countries with appropriate waste treatment and storage facilities.

"Land and sustainable agriculture"

14. The following additional proposals were made:

(a) Greater care must be taken that the mining of minerals and oil does not result in degradation of land and water resources, and that the extraction of primary resources from indigenous peoples' lands does not threaten their property rights;

(b) Full support, both political and financial, is urgently needed for the United Nations Convention to Combat Desertification in those Countries Experiencing Serious Drought and/or Desertification, particularly in Africa, the implementation of which will be a major vehicle for alleviating poverty.

"Biodiversity"

15. It was proposed that the General Assembly at the special session support an initiative to set up a worldwide network of protected areas with high levels of

/...

biodiversity - the so-called hot spots - under the Convention on Biological Diversity.

"Small island developing States"

16. It was proposed that:

(a) The review process for the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States be made consistent with the review processes for the implementation of other United Nations global conferences;

(b) A permanent implementation and coordination mechanism for small island developing States be established.

3. "Means of implementation"

"Financial resources and mechanisms"

17. Many speakers noted the need for a strong reaffirmation of the commitments made at UNCED, especially the targets of contributing 0.7 per cent of GNP to ODA and committing 0.15 per cent of GNP to assistance for the least developed countries. In addition to measures already proposed, it was suggested that:

(a) ODA be concentrated on the poorest countries and used to create favourable conditions for FDI;

(b) Twenty per cent of ODA be derived from innovative financial mechanisms, including a tax on short-term capital movements and a tax on aviation fuel, over the next five years;

(c) ODA equal to 0.1 per cent of GNP be used to support environmental concerns;

(d) Political support be given to continue the work of the Commission's Expert Group on Finance;

(e) Clear financial resources be made available for each environmental convention, for water, for forests and for desertification;

(f) Additional financial resources for sustainable development be made available from disarmament;

(g) GEF replenishment not be achieved at the expense of other aid programmes.

"Transfer of environmentally sound technologies"

18. It was stressed that there is a need to ensure that future patterns of development, particularly in the developing countries, are less polluting and less energy-intensive and resource-intensive than the patterns of development

/...

that historically dominated in the developed countries. To that end, it was proposed that:

(a) An international commission be established within three years to fund the acquisition of patent rights and licenses and make them available to developing countries;

(b) An inventory of publicly owned, available environmentally sound technologies (ESTs) be developed and maintained, for their transfer to developing countries through a clearing house mechanism;

(c) An International Task Force on the transfer and exchange of ESTs be established under the Commission, in cooperation with the private sector;

(d) Regional technology centres be established, within the regional commissions;

(e) Countries adopt policies that prohibit the export of environmentally inferior technologies which are not used domestically.

"Capacity-building"

19. It was proposed that funding be increased for the Capacity 21 initiative of the United Nations Development Programme.

"D. International institutional arrangements"

"1. Greater coherence in various intergovernmental organizations and processes"

20. It was proposed that more innovative forms of international cooperation are needed, such as bilateral agreements on sustainable development, which can be replicated in other countries.

"2. Role of relevant organizations and institutions of the United Nations system"

21. There is a need for greater involvement of national policy makers responsible for finance, economic planning and development, as well as specific economic sectors in future sustainable development work, both in national decision-making and in the work of the Commission.

22. Many delegations stressed the need for a stronger, adequately funded and revitalized United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), operating under clear objectives, and with a stronger regional presence.

23. There is a need to rationalize, throughout the United Nations system, meetings related to the environment, including conventions, and to raise the overall efficiency and effectiveness of such meetings.

"3. Future role and programme of work of the Commission on Sustainable Development"

24. Broad support was expressed for the programme of work outlined in the report of the Secretary-General (E/CN.17/1997/2), although there were widely different views on the annual programmes. Additional proposals included:

(a) The Commission should focus its future work on (i) areas in which global action is needed but an adequate intergovernmental process is missing (as was the case with forests); (ii) areas in which ongoing global action is not producing adequate results;

(b) The future work programme of the Commission should aim to include issues that attract not only environment ministers but also minsters of finance, development and trade, energy and transport etc;

(c) The Commission should enhance its role as a coordinator, bringing together WTO, UNEP, United Nations Conference on Trade and Development and other organizations and stakeholders to assist in developing new ideas and win-win solutions.

/...

Annex II

SUMMARY REPORTS OF THE WORKING GROUP OF THE COMMISSION

A. Summary report of the dialogue session with children and youth

(11 April 1997)

Chairman: Ambassador John Ashe (Antigua and Barbuda), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitators: Ms. Danijela Zunec, Rescue Mission-Croatia, and Mr. Peter Wilson, Global Kids, Jamaica/USA

Presenters: Representatives of the following non-governmental youth organizations made presentations: Rescue Mission: Planet Earth; Canadian Environmental Network-Youth Caucus; Latin American Youth Network (REJULADS); Q2000; PlayFair! Europe; International Youth and Student Movement for the United Nations; ASEED-Europe, ASEED-Japan, and ASEED-Australia; Students Partnership Worldwide; and, Global Kids, Jamaica/USA

PRESENTATIONS

The panellists highlighted the importance of chapter 25 (Children and youth in sustainable development) of Agenda 21. In describing their numerous activities, youth participants demonstrated the unique role that young people play in furthering the implementation of Agenda 21. Youth participants also discussed the major obstacles they are encountering and outlined priorities for the future.

Activities

As described in their presentations, young people are undertaking a diverse array of sustainable development initiatives. Their efforts aim at raising awareness, strengthening bilateral partnerships, improving the environment, and addressing social problems. Some of these activities are listed below.

- School seminars, theatre productions, posters, stickers, newsletters, web sites, protests, lobbying, and participation in local decision-making have been instrumental in promoting understanding of, and attention to, sustainable development.

- The Children's Version of Agenda 21, and two reports on sustainability indicators (Mission Made Possible, 1996, and Future Watch, 1997), prepared by the Rescue Mission: Planet Earth network, have increased the accessibility of the sustainable development concept to young people around the world.

- Bilateral cooperation (Japanese/Swedish partners and Canadian/Latin American partners) have built youth partnerships for sustainable development beyond national borders.

- Recycling, reuse and regeneration, tree planting and stream enhancement have been important efforts in directly improving the environment.

- Young people have helped direct attention to social problems such as homelessness. A video made by Global Kids, for example, depicts the perspectives of the homeless and the problems they face, and proposes possible solutions.

Obstacles

Despite their numerous achievements, youth participants pointed out that certain obstacles prevent them from making even greater contributions to sustainable development. As described below, these obstacles involve lack of awareness regarding sustainability issues, limited access to information and decision-making, political corruption, gender inequities and consumerism.

- Few local people are aware of Agenda 21 and Governments are reluctant to assume leadership to run national awareness-raising campaigns.

- The closed, bureaucratic nature of many Governments reduce adequate youth access to information or participation in decision-making.

- The low attendance of delegations at the dialogue session reflects some of the problems young people face in getting Governments to listen to them.

- In some Governments, corruption prevents realization of sustainable development.

- Gender prejudices in some countries diminish the education of women and young girls, thereby weakening efforts for a sustainable world.

- Current patterns of consumption are a threat to sustainable development in many areas.

Priorities

Youth participants highlighted three priority areas for the future: funding, education and participation. As indicated below, progress in these areas is important for furthering the involvement of youth in future sustainable development efforts.

- Young people constitute 50 per cent of the population. The allocation of government funds should be more transparent and should better reflect the size of the youth constituency.

- Education is essential for promoting sustainability and should be strengthened via partnerships between schools, Governments, universities and non-formal educators, and attention to the preservation of indigenous resources and practices.

- Young people themselves can be important in educating and raising awareness not only among themselves (through peer education) but also among adults.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements: Australia, Belgium, Canada, Jamaica, Jordan, France, Ghana, Hungary, Ireland, Jamaica, Netherlands, Norway, Panama, Philippines, Romania, Sudan, United Republic of Tanzania, Uganda, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America. The representative of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) made a statement. The representative of the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) also made a statement.

In their statements, government representatives commended the youth groups on their accomplishments, particularly for their work on sustainable development indicators and their other awareness-raising efforts (United States and Jamaica). Some representatives stated that the low attendance at the meeting was due to many simultaneous meetings rather than a lack of interests on the part of Governments (Belgium). One representative noted that some of the young panellists might become government representatives themselves and that they should remember the empty seats today to make sure that they were not empty in the future (Hungary).

Several government representatives provided advice for the future. One representative advised the panellists to be more demanding of Governments and to secure media coverage for their presentations (United Republic of Tanzania). Others advised young people to demonstrate sustainable lifestyles (United Kingdom) and some suggested involving more young people in future United Nations meetings. One representative requested the panellists to outline their hopes for the forthcoming special session of the General Assembly (Canada).

Comments were also made on financial and economic issues. Child labour, for example, is a serious problem in some countries and one which youth participants might wish to confront (ICFTU). Children and youth are often the target of those who want to promote unsustainable consumption patterns (Philippines). Yet peer education can be instrumental in resisting adoption of such patterns (Ireland). Micro-financing can be important for youth at local to national levels (Uganda).

In responding to these comments, panellists acknowledged the importance of micro-financing and highlighted various forms of effective education. They also emphasized the need for activities at the grass-roots level; increased access to information; new and innovative endeavours to involve youth; financial commitments; and new ways for designing education.

/...

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The Commission on Sustainable Development should acknowledge and aim at furthering the efforts of young people concerned about sustainable development. Some ways to encourage the enthusiasm, creativity and commitment exhibited by these young people are described below:

- Recognize that young people have much to offer and allow them to exercise their skills for sustainable development efforts within the United Nations.
- Encourage Governments to supply funding for youth activities.
- Establish a Commission on Sustainable Development youth consultancy programme (a pilot effort in this area in 1996 has enabled young people to participate directly in Commission activities and enhance their global network).
- Include youth in international forums and promote attention to youth concerns and contributions.
- Encourage countries to include youth representatives in national delegations to the Commission on Sustainable Development.
- Work to allow young people access to information.
- Promote innovative forms of education and creative ways to involve youth in decision-making processes.

B. Summary report of the dialogue session with scientific and technological communities

(11 April 1997)

Chairman: Ambassador John Ashe (Antigua and Barbuda), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitator: Ms. Julia Marton-Lefevre, Executive Director, International Council of Scientific Unions (ICSU)

Presenters: Representatives of the following organizations and programmes made presentations: International Council of Scientific Unions (ICSU); Third World Academy of Sciences; Committee on Science and Technology in Developing Countries (COSTED-IBN); World Federation of Engineering Organizations (WFEO); Global Change System for Analysis, Research and Training (START); Committee for the International Human Dimensions of Global Environmental Change Programme (IHDP); Species Survival Commission (International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN)).

/...

PRESENTATIONS

Scientists around the world, particularly those from the ICSU and IUCN networks, have been contributing to the field of environment and development for several decades, most notably through contributions to the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment (1972, Stockholm) and the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (1992, Rio de Janeiro). In their presentations, scientists noted their current activities, the obstacles they face and priorities for the future.

Activities

Panellists highlighted ongoing research and observation programmes, growing recognition of sustainable development issues, and partnerships that link the scientific community with other groups.

- There is an important need for local solutions and the engagement of local expertise, particularly in the developing countries, in addressing sustainability challenges. Many scientific organizations are therefore focusing on capacity-building.

- Scientific organizations are developing advisory support round tables and partnerships with other major groups such as business and industry, to cultivate relationships that enhance scientific interface in global change.

- Some professional organizations, such as the American Society of Civil Engineers, have incorporated sustainable development principles in their code of ethics.

Obstacles

Obstacles to furthering science for environment and development involve funding, relationships between different disciplinary cultures, inequities between North and South, and difficulties in engaging the policy community. For example:

- Funds for research in the areas of sustainable development are often lacking.

- Research on sustainable development issues requires expertise from many different disciplines. Scientists with different backgrounds are still unaccustomed to working together.

- There is a shortage of developing country scientists and those that are available have inadequate participation in and inadequate access to decision-making processes.

- Scientists are often unable to engage the policy community effectively.

Priorities

Panellists outlined several priority areas. These address relationships within the scientific community, as well as those between that community, policy makers and the public.

- Multidisciplinary partnerships among natural scientists, social scientists and engineers are important for sustainable development.
- Women should play a larger role in science and technology endeavours.
- Regional and interregional cooperation is important for sustainable development.
- Science should be directed towards applicable, problem-solving efforts, using a bottom-up approach.
- Engineers should consider long-term costs in their design processes.
- Policy should be based on sound science, and dialogue between science and policy communities should increase.
- Public awareness of science and scientific knowledge related to sustainable development need to be further cultivated.
- Scientific capacity-building including through North-South and South-South cooperation.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements: Czech Republic, Ghana, Indonesia, Japan, Malaysia, Norway, Philippines, Switzerland, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America. A statement was also made by the representative of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).

Some representatives requested scientists to comment more specifically on what they want from Governments (Norway and Switzerland). Several representatives noted the importance of improving public understanding of sustainable development and the scientific knowledge needed for it (United States, Indonesia). Others noted the lack of scientific information in the media (Czech Republic), and the difficulties in understanding the scientific information that is disseminated (Ghana). Some representatives noted links between science and Government (Japan) and between the scientific community and private sector research and development (Philippines). Others asked about best and worst practice issues (United Kingdom) and about the efficacy of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) (Malaysia). UNESCO highlighted the urgent need to increase scientific capacity and funding for science and technology at both the national and international levels.

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Some challenges and recommendations are set out below.

- Encourage support for basic science education and research for environment and development issues.
- Assist developing countries in national scientific capacity-building.
- Support coordination within the scientific community.
- Raise public awareness of scientific and technological issues related to sustainable development.
- Package scientific information such that it is understandable and accessible by ordinary citizens as well as policy makers.
- Facilitate dialogue between scientists and decision makers.
- Compile and disseminate information on lessons learned in science and technology.
- Improve relationships between the scientific community and the media.
- Encourage private sector research and development activities for sustainable development.
- Create direct dialogue opportunities between the Commission on Sustainable Development and the representatives of the scientific community on specific topical areas of sustainable development.

C. Summary report of the dialogue session with workers and trade unions

(14 April 1997)

Chairman: Ambassador Bagher Asadi (Islamic Republic of Iran), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable development

Facilitator: Ms. Clayola Brown, Union of Needletrades, Industrial and Textile Employees (UNITE), United States of America

Presenters: Representatives of the following organizations and programmes made presentations: Union of Needletrades, Industrial and Textile Employees, United States of America; Central Unica dos Trabalhadores, Brazil; Graphical Workers' Union, Sweden; Canadian Labor Congress; Mine, Geological and Oil Workers, Czech Republic; Laborers' International Union, United States of America; Zimbabwe Council of Trade Unions; Indian National Trade Union Congress; Worker Education and Environment, ACTRAV/ILO Project; Swedish

Confederation of Professional Employees; United Kingdom Trades Union Congress; Bangladesh Independent Garment Workers Union; Trade Union Advisory Committee of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development.

PRESENTATIONS

Many global sustainability problems, such as hunger, ill-health, illiteracy, unemployment, industrial accidents and social tensions, have actually increased since the 1992 Rio Conference. Trade unions have recognized these trends and want to address them. Trade unions have therefore collected success stories and extracted from them the concept of "collective engagement". This engagement entails education, consultation and action which harnesses the energies of workers and other members of society in transforming ideas about sustainable development into action.

Activities

Trade unionists have undertaken a spectrum of activities ranging from harmonization and standard-setting to eco-labelling. The following are examples:

- Tripartite negotiations involving industry, workers and government in Brazil resulted in an accord regarding control of chemicals, such as benzene, in the workplace.

- Cooperative efforts between municipal officials, unions and industry in Sweden led to the development of ecologically friendly practices in the printing industry. The holistic approach adopted led to substitution and recycling of chemicals and improvements in water quality and biological diversity.

- The latest session of the Intergovernmental Forum on Chemical Safety has seen increased cooperation between labour and international environmental non-governmental organizations (NGOs).

- Trade unions have worked to support progressive standards of chemical labelling.

- A union of mine workers from the Czech Republic engaged the expertise of Cornell University to help the union raise the ecological consciousness of its members and other community members via training and participation in eco-audits.

- The Laborers' International Union of North America has contributed to remediation and environmental clean-up concerning hazardous wastes.

- The Zimbabwe Council of Trade Unions helped to identify how trade unions in developing countries can help to alleviate poverty.

/...

- The Swedish Confederation of Professional Employees has carried out eco-labelling and integrated office management programmes.

- Groups in the United Kingdom have developed the EcoManagement and Audit Scheme, which involves monitoring, observing, record-keeping, reporting, evaluating and making changes in regard to worksite health, safety and environment programmes.

- The Bangladesh Independent Garment Workers Union illustrated how enforceable codes of conduct might be used as mechanisms for implementing sustainable development.

- The ACTRAV/ILO Project has developed extensive training materials and programmes around ILO conventions and recommendations as sustainable development indicators.

Obstacles

Trade unions identified several obstacles to their sustainable development efforts and to the realization of sustainable development in general. Foremost among these are obstacles concerning lack of workers' rights, barriers to participation, and insufficient funds. For example:

- International organizations often do not recognize the role that workers and trade unions play and can play in furthering sustainable development through workplace cooperation.

- Workers are often denied their rights, particularly the freedom to associate.

- Governments and other social groups have resisted the participation of trade unions in collective efforts to address sustainable development issues.

- Trade unions' efforts to further sustainable development require monetary resources, resources which international organizations and other donor institutions are not readily providing.

- Poverty is an obstacle to sustainable development in general and therefore frustrates the efforts of trade unions in attempting to further sustainable practices.

- Distortions in the global trading system obstruct efforts to realize a sustainable world.

- Provisions for capacity-building have not been effective, particularly regarding chapter 19, section B, of Agenda 21 on the harmonization of classification and labelling of chemicals.

Priorities

Many of the following priorities point towards increased awareness of trade union interest in sustainable development:

- Put the workplace at the top of the sustainable development agenda, particularly with respect to production and consumption patterns.
- Encourage the active participation of workers in workplace environmental audits.
- Encourage trade union/employer partnerships and agreements in implementing Agenda 21 objectives.
- Gain access to decision-making bodies that address sustainable development issues.
- Ensure workers' rights throughout the world.
- Address people's immediate needs, especially those arising from poverty, before pursuing sustainable development.
- Address the political, social and economic issues attendant to sustainable development.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements: Ecuador, Netherlands, Philippines, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America. A statement was also made by the representative of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNDP).

One government representative welcomed the concept of collective engagement and asked how to further the realization of this concept (United States). Others asked about the applicability of the EcoManagement and Auditing Scheme (EMAS) in developing countries and the relationship between EMAS and ISO 14,000. One government representative warned against reliance on market forces (Netherlands). Those who noted the growing importance of informal economies and the absence of the right mechanisms to deal with sustainability also called for national systems of regulation to ensure health and environmental protection (Ecuador). One government representative noted that NGOs were the main forces resisting the inclusion of trade unions on his country's Council for Sustainable Development (Philippines). The representative of UNEP posed a question on the involvement of workers and trade unions in voluntary environmental codes and programmes that are being developed by business and industry.

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Challenges and recommendations focused on increased recognition of linkages between sustainable development and the workplace, as well as greater worker and trade union participation in decision-making bodies. For example:

- Put the workplace at the top of the sustainable development agenda, especially for changes to production and consumption patterns.
- Recognize the role that trade unions can play in furthering sustainable development.
- Encourage cooperation among employers, workers and Governments.
- Support ILO initiatives and work to integrate ILO programmes and sustainable development activities.
- Encourage Governments to develop workplace linkages to national reporting and monitoring systems.
- Encourage Governments to include trade union representatives in decision-making regarding sustainable development.
- Support making eco-management and audit practices compulsory, open to the public and independently validated.
- Urge Governments to support NGOs and trade unions in eco-labelling programmes.
- Encourage environmental education at all levels in the school system.
- Ensure adherence to safety, health, environment and child labour laws in producer countries and promote the use of codes of conduct in implementing sustainable development initiatives.

D. Summary report of the dialogue session with women

(14 April 1997)

Chairperson: Ms. Monika Linn-Locher (Switzerland), Vice-Chairperson, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitator: Ms. Bella Abzug, President, Women's Environment and Development Organization, United States of America

Presenters: Representatives of the following women's organizations made presentations: Country Women Association of Nigeria; Women Food and Agriculture Working Group/Via Campesina (United States); Central and Eastern European Network for Sustainable Consumption and Production (Poland); REDEH Network in Defense of Humankind

/...

(Brazil); Movement for Nuclear Safety (Russian Federation); NGO Campaign for the Earth Council (Canada); Perzent Center (Pakistan); Red Thread (Guyana).

PRESENTATIONS

Women are represented in and reflect all nine major groups defined in Agenda 21. Women across class, race, ethnicity and location have come to serve as catalysts for environmental and democratic activism. Yet, despite the two years since the 1995 Beijing Conference and the five years that have passed since the Rio Conference, women comprise the majority of the poor, the landless and the under-fed. In their dialogue session with Government, women highlighted these problems, the obstacles they face in confronting them, and made recommendations for future action.

Activities

Women succeeded in gaining a Principle in Rio Declaration, a chapter and over 170 references to them mainstreamed throughout Agenda 21. Thereafter, women ensured that their holistic gender analysis infused the process and documents of other international conferences, particularly the Beijing Platform for Action in 1995. A number of relevant initiatives have been taken by and for women. For example:

- The Women's Caucus has enabled women to participate in international negotiations and policy-making.

- The 1995 Beijing Conference was instrumental in calling attention to poverty and its effects on the lives of women.

- The 1997 Micro-Summit in Washington, D.C., highlighted the importance of providing credit to poor women. This Summit led to the decision to provide $21.7 billion in micro-credit to poor people by the year 2005.

- The Women's Food Summit called attention to linkages between sustainable development and world food security.

- Local Agenda 21 efforts are successfully under way around the world. They have helped strengthen mechanisms to integrate women in decision-making processes and are helping to alter unsustainable production and consumption patterns.

Obstacles

Women are key to achieving sustainable development. Thus, the inequities and prejudices that confront women also hinder general progress towards sustainability. Specific obstacles concern lack of representation and credit, as well as poverty, trade and debt-related issues.

/...

- Although women constitute over 50 per cent of the world's population, women constitute far less than the same ratio in Governments throughout the world.

- Participation by non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in the United Nations is limited and stifles the important voice of women.

- Lack of credit for women prevents them from achieving financial independence.

- Barriers to land ownership by women not only stifle their prospects for financial independence but also create disincentives for following sustainable practices.

- Trade imbalances and debt crises contribute to poverty-related problems which are particularly troubling for women.

- The growing emphasis on food as a commodity and on agro-business has negative effects regarding sustainable agriculture and world food security. This has important implications for women farmers, as well as for the well-being of women and children.

- Testing of toxic materials, radioactive pollution and the use of pesticides are violating the health and reproductive rights of women.

- The rights of indigenous women are not recognized.

- Current modes of advertising denigrate women and contribute to unsustainable patterns of production and consumption.

Priorities

Women's representatives raised the following priorities for consideration by the Commission on Sustainable Development and other actors involved in the sustainable development process:

- Mechanisms that promote representation of women in Government.

- Access to credit to empower women and combat poverty.

- Equal access to education.

- Subsidy removal and taxes that counteract the negative effects of commercial advertising, such as gender stereotyping.

- Learning from the Local Agenda 21 initiatives.

- Action-oriented efforts to deal with industrial "hot spots" and other environmental hazards such as radioactive waste.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements: Australia, Canada, China, Cuba, Egypt, Finland, Netherlands, Norway, Peru, Philippines, Sweden, Switzerland, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland. Representatives of the International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (INSTRAW) and the Campaign for the Earth International, a non-governmental organization, also made statements.

Some government representatives described their efforts in micro-financing (Australia, Bangladesh, Netherlands, Switzerland) and in mainstreaming women's concerns (Philippines, China). Others identified poverty as the main obstacle to achieving the goals outlined at the Beijing Conference and urged countries to promote capacity-building for women and provide special attention to women in indigenous communities (Peru). The representative of INSTRAW noted poverty issues concerning women.

Government representatives also discussed the role of women in agricultural production (Sweden) and trade, including export-driven, monoculture economies (Cuba, Netherlands), food security and hostile food policies (Cuba). One government representative noted linkages between the transboundary movement of hazardous material and women's health (Australia).

Several government representatives noted the importance of addressing the role of men and how men perceive themselves in society (Sweden). Some government representatives noted that gender issues required policies for men as well as women (Sweden, Norway). For example, some countries require parental leave for men (Norway).

One government representative noted that regional or global hot-spot designations are not feasible for certain environmental problems and that national designations would be necessary in most cases (Egypt). Some government representatives noted that the conclusions of the Commission on the Status of Women should be incorporated into the decisions of the Commission on Sustainable Development (Finland).

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

- Ensure full and equal participation of women in decision-making at every level of all social, political and economic areas.

- Commit the necessary resources and establish time-bound targets for integrating women fully into the development of policies, institutions, mechanisms, implementation and evaluation of all future plans for sustainable development.

- Ensure that women's reproductive and productive contributions are measured, valuated and integrated into national accounts and in the calculation of national wealth.

- Identify industrial hot spots and prepare a plan to clean these areas.

- Regulate commercial advertising and identify instruments to combat its negative effects.

- Ensure that ongoing negotiations on the multilateral agreement on investment will equally address the rights and responsibilities of corporations in sustainable development processes.

- Establish a mechanism within the Commission to monitor and guide the actions of the World Trade Organization.

- Earmark 1 per cent of all funding dispersed via the World Bank, regional development banks and other international financial institutions to support rural women, who make up the main share of the world's 1.3 billion poor.

- Support appropriate and gender-fair education, health, recreation, child-care and other infrastructural systems designed by and for rural communities.

- Promote "sustainable agriculture" rather than "agricultural sustainability".

- Affirm and pledge to reach the Micro-credit Summit (Washington, D.C., February 1997) goal of raising $21.7 billion to ensure that 100 million of the world's poorest women and their families receive credit for self-employment by the year 2005.

- Remove legislative, policy, administrative and customary barriers to women's equal rights to natural resources, including access to and control over land (and other forms of property), credit, inheritance, information, and new technology.

- Strengthen the reporting requirements by Governments to the Commission and improve links with other relevant bodies of the Economic and Social Council such as the Commission on the Status of Women.

- Review and address the impact on women's public and private sector genetic research, bio-prospecting, bio-trade and bio-technology policies and programmes.

- Strengthen the role of women in efforts to implement Agenda 21. In doing this, the Commission should examine examples where efforts to increase participation have been successful and disseminate this information widely.

E. Summary report of the dialogue session with indigenous people

(15 April 1997)

Chairman: Mr. Czeslaw Wieckowski (Poland), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitator: Mr. Devashish Roy, Chakma Peoples, Bangladesh (Bangladesh Indigenous and Hill Peoples Association for Advancement)

Presenters: Representatives of the following groups made presentations: Quechua, Ecuador; Kuna People, Panama (International Alliance of Indigenous and Tribal Peoples of the Tropical Forests); Nuuk, Greenland (Inuit Circumpolar Conference); Maori, New Zealand (Maori Congress); Ogoni, Nigeria (National Youth Council of Ogoni People); Kankanaey, Philippines (Asian Indigenous Women's Network); Quechua, United States (International Indian Treaty Council).

PRESENTATIONS

As noted in the Quechua prayer that opened the session: "people belong to the Earth, the Earth does not belong to them". Although indigenous peoples are mindful of this concept and have much to offer through their sustainable lifestyles, their needs continue to be overlooked. In the five years since the Rio Conference, indigenous groups have become more vocal and visible at the international level in defence of Mother Earth. However, their situation at the regional, national and local levels has worsened as they confront increased discrimination regarding their economic, social, civil and cultural rights. In their dialogue session, representatives of a number of indigenous communities shared their experiences and highlighted some of the more pressing problems they face. In doing so, they highlighted the important links between the concerns of Indigenous People and other issues outlined in Agenda 21, including poverty, human settlements, rural development, farmers, women, biodiversity and forests.

Activities

Indigenous peoples have championed a number of activities pertaining to sustainable development. These include:

- Continued application of sustainable practices in everyday life.
- Contributions to the preparation of the draft United Nations declaration on the rights of indigenous people.
- Support of international forums concerning forestry, biodiversity and intellectual and cultural property rights.
- Legal action against those pursuing unsustainable mining practices.

- Action that convinced the Government of the United States of America to suspend patenting of genes from the Hagai People of Papua New Guinea.

Obstacles

Obstacles to furthering the cause of indigenous peoples include prejudiced perceptions about indigenous peoples, lack of representation in decision-making forums, globalization and trade barriers.

- Non-indigenous people often hold a prejudiced view of indigenous peoples or stereotype them as "noble savages" with primitive lifestyles and static communities.

- Many non-indigenous people hold a reductionist view in which they fail to recognize the important linkages between indigenous peoples and the ecosystems in which they live.

- Indigenous peoples continue to suffer from poverty, hunger, war, debt, pollution, disease, illiteracy and homelessness caused by unsustainable development.

- Most international agreements fail to address the needs of indigenous peoples adequately. For example, the concept of "territories" does not appear in Agenda 21 or the Forest Principles. Agenda 21 portrays indigenous peoples and their traditional practices as objects of research for commercialization. It also makes little reference to indigenous peoples in the Arctic regions or to the negative impact of mining activities on indigenous communities.

- Indigenous peoples lack representation in international and national forums.

- Trade barriers instituted by European countries and the United States are often harmful to indigenous peoples (such barriers include the 1983 European ban on seal pelts, the 1991 European ban on importation of wild furs from leg-hold traps and the United States Marine Mammal Protection Act).

- Use of hazardous chemicals, global warming, long-range transboundary air pollution and loss of biological diversity have particularly negative implications for indigenous groups in the Arctic regions.

- Multilateral trading systems, economic globalization and trade liberalization are promoting a free market in which corporations hold a great deal of power, little social responsibility and no local accountability.

- Increased dam building is promoting displacement and marginalization of indigenous peoples.

- Biopiracy, bioengineering and bioprospecting exploit the traditional views and practices of indigenous peoples.

- Development and some conservation programmes often prompt militarization of indigenous peoples' communities and subsequent violations of their rights.

Priorities

- The territorial rights of indigenous peoples should be respected and recognized.
- Indigenous self-determination should be recognized as an integral part of sustainable development.
- Indigenous peoples want to determine their own course of development, control their affairs and resources, and participate directly and fully in decision-making that affects them.
- Indigenous peoples want to exercise rights over the resources of the ecosystems of their traditional territories.
- Indigenous peoples urge further progress and action on international conventions for climate change, biological diversity and long-range transboundary air pollution.
- Indigenous peoples should be represented at the highest level in the United Nations system.
- Sustainable development issues should be addressed in a comprehensive manner and not reduced to isolated sectoral considerations.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following countries made statements: Canada, Denmark, Nigeria, Peru and the United States of America. The representative of a non-governmental organization (NGO) from Guyana and an indigenous peoples' representative from the United States (Sovereign Dineh Nation) also made statements.

Some dialogue participants noted issues regarding indigenous peoples in their countries. In response to a panellist who described the oppression of the Ogoni people in Nigeria, one government representative noted that the Ogoni are considered an ethnic group in Nigeria and not indigenous peoples (Nigeria). Another government representative recalled the numerous problems that indigenous peoples in his country faced including drug trafficking, civil strife, environmental degradation and migration. He expressed solidarity with the panellists (Peru). Other government representatives noted the efforts of their Governments in furthering the interests of indigenous peoples via the draft United Nations declaration on the rights of indigenous people (Canada) and workshops concerning a permanent forum for indigenous peoples (Canada and Denmark).

Some countries explicitly addressed Arctic Council (Canada, United States) and Dineh Nation issues (United States). In response to an Inuit panellist, one representative noted that his Government believed that forums other than the Arctic Council were more appropriate for addressing marine mammal issues (United States). Another government representative responded that the Arctic Council was capable of making its own decisions (Canada). The Inuit panellist emphasized that acts that prevented the Inuit from using mammal resources were adversely affecting their traditional lives and economies.

The representative of an NGO suggested that international organizations should develop funding criteria to guide decision-making on financing of mining projects (Guyana). An indigenous peoples' representative from the United States called attention to the relocation of her people to make way for coal mines (Sovereign Dineh Nation).

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The primary challenges and recommendations for the Commission concern participation, funding, information, biological diversity and trade issues.

- The international community should recognize indigenous peoples as peoples and not as non-governmental organizations.

- The United Nations should establish a permanent forum for indigenous peoples.

- Forest policy forums at all levels must establish mechanisms to ensure equal and full participation of indigenous peoples and other forest-dependent people in decision-making.

- The scope of the United Nations Voluntary Fund for Indigenous Populations should be expanded so as to enable greater participation by representatives of indigenous peoples in the full range of United Nations activities.

- The United Nations should improve the dissemination of information to indigenous peoples.

- The international community should address issues concerning biological diversity, such as biotechnology, bioprospecting and the Human Genome Diversity Project. Institutions and conventions dealing with these issues must allow for the participation of indigenous peoples. A biosafety protocol under the Convention on Biological Diversity should be speedily accepted.

Indigenous peoples specifically requested the Commission to:

- Promote the immediate adoption of the draft United Nations declaration on the rights of the indigenous people in its current form.

- Examine the impacts of globalization, the World Trade Organization and regional agreements on intellectual property rights (e.g., APEC and NAFTA) on indigenous communities.

- Review the activities of transnational corporations, especially the extractive industries such as mining and timber, and examine the effects of these businesses on indigenous peoples. Methods of conflict resolution should be among the issues considered.

- Promote dialogue between indigenous and non-indigenous groups and Governments at the international, national and local levels.

- Participate in the workshop regarding a United Nations permanent forum for indigenous peoples, to be held in Chile in June 1997.

F. Summary report of the dialogue session with non-governmental organizations

(15 April 1997)

Chairman: Mr. Czeslaw Wieckowski (Poland), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitator: Mr. Roberto Bissio, Instituto del Tercer Mundo

Presenters: Representatives of the following organizations made presentations: Environmental Liaison Center International (ELCI); Association of Small Farmers of the Pacific Coast (Costa Rica); Country Women's Association of Nigeria (COWAN); Friends of the Earth International; Environmental Justice Networking Forum (South Africa); Third World Network; Latin American Network on Forests; Consumers International.

PRESENTATIONS

In the five years since the Rio Conference, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have played an increasingly important role in efforts to further sustainable development throughout the world. In their dialogue session, NGOs highlighted past NGO activities, discussed Agenda 21 implementation at the local, national and regional levels and set forth actions for the Commission on Sustainable Development to undertake in the next five years.

Activities

The dialogue session provided a sampling of NGO activities. These included research on Agenda 21 implementation, studies regarding sustainable development indicators and organization of new grass-roots groups. For example:

- A study by ELCI assessed grass-roots action taken on Agenda 21 and made recommendations for the future. The resultant report, entitled "Grass-roots reflection on Agenda 21", reveals that Governments are treating the superficial manifestations of unsustainable practices rather than the underlying causes. Furthermore, local level implementation is not occurring as fast as it should be.

- Friends of the Earth conducted a study of sustainable development indicators.

- NGOs in Costa Rica have improved dialogue with government officials.

- African women have established networks for rural and grass-roots women.

- Women in Nigeria developed a strategy for gaining credit for women.

- NGOs in South Africa are working to further environmental justice issues and develop environmental policies for sustainability.

Obstacles

Obstacles to NGO success under Agenda 21 include ingrained production and consumption patterns, lack of access to decision-making, trade liberalization and low political will in regard to sustainable development issues. For example:

- Government interest is often lacking in regard to Agenda 21 implementation.

- NGOs are often excluded from government decision-making, especially in countries with rigid and closed governmental processes.

- It is often difficult to convince decision makers to act on initiatives developed at the community level.

- Business and industry are often unwilling to become involved with sustainable development issues.

- Inequity at the local, national and global levels obstructs many efforts towards sustainable development.

- Political will is lacking in forestry issues.

- Education is an important yet overlooked component of sustainable development.

- Deregulation and globalization are increasing the power of transnational corporations and increasing the inequities between rich and poor.

- Lack of resources is an important limiting factor for NGOs.

Priorities

NGOs outlined a spectrum of priorities including eco-sufficiency, NGO/government relations, environmental education and trade. For example:

- Eco-sufficiency should replace the concept of eco-efficiency if society is to become truly sustainable.

- Better mechanisms for NGO/government cooperation are needed at the local and national levels.

- Better mechanisms should be developed for communicating local experiences to the global level and fostering learning.

- Capacity-building should occur in the government sector as well as in the NGO sector.

- Education and awareness-raising should play a larger role in sustainable development efforts.

- Governments should honour commitments they have made for technology sharing and technology transfer.

- NGO collaboration with Governments at the local, national and international levels should be enhanced.

- Changes in production and consumption patterns are essential.

- Trade has important impacts on environment and development and should receive high priority in efforts to promote sustainable development.

- Corporate accountability should be addressed explicitly and should ensure attention to social and environmental responsibilities.

DIALOGUE

Representative of the following countries made statements during the dialogue session: Australia, China, Finland, Japan, Norway, Philippines, Sweden, United States of America. Statements were made by the following NGOs: Q2000 of Sweden, NGO Working Group on Women, Health and Environment, NGO Education Caucus, Costa Rican National Council for NGOs, Association of Northern Peoples for Environment and Development. NGOs from Bolivia, Mauritius and the Russian Federation also made statements, as did the representative of the European Commission.

Several government representatives described local initiatives in their countries. One government representative noted the important role that local municipalities played via monitoring, inspection and enforcement to ensure adherence to environmental standards (Japan). Others noted the positive results that Agenda 21 implementation had yielded in their countries (China, Philippines, Sweden). One NGO representative noted increased coordination between NGOs and Government under Agenda 21 (NGO from Bolivia). Another NGO representative noted the problems of addressing energy and transportation issues in her country (NGO from Sweden). Another noted the lack of NGO participation in policy decision-making (NGO from the Russian Federation).

One government representative elicited several comments from others when she suggested that the Commission on Sustainable Development adopt a procedure instituted under the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Australia). For this Convention, NGOs should prepare country reports and Governments would be required to respond to those reports. An NGO panellist responded favourably to the suggestion but noted the financial constraints facing NGOs. Another government representative suggested that NGOs and Governments collaborate on reports, as was done in his country (Philippines).

An NGO representative noted the lack of government reporting to the Commission and inquired about the procedures countries follow in reporting to their constituencies at home (Friends of the Earth). Some government representatives described their reporting procedures. Reporting processes involved numerous stakeholders, meetings, web sites and media (Australia, Canada, Finland, Norway, Sweden, United States).

One NGO representative noted the need for more emphasis on education regarding sustainability issues and noted the lack of educator participation (Education Caucus). Another noted the important educational role that United Nations documents played in her country (NGO from the Russian Federation).

One representative urged that statistics like those presented by Friends of the Earth International be used to convince the unconvinced to take up sustainable development priorities (European Commission). Another suggested that the results of the ELCI study be widely disseminated (NGO from Mauritius).

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

NGOs presented several recommendations to the Commission. These recommendations concern increased dialogue between NGOs and Governments, corporate accountability, trade issues and action on forest problems. In particular, NGOs requested the Commission to:

- Encourage dialogue at the local and national levels as well as at the international level.
- Incorporate trade and environment, trade and development, and the intersection of trade, environment and development into Agenda 21 initiatives and into the future work of the Commission.
- Establish a subcommission or panel on trade and sustainable development.
- Initiate a dialogue with the World Trade Organization and its Committee on Trade and Environment.
- Initiate a new round of commodity agreements.
- Facilitate a sustainable development and equity review of World Trade Organization agreements.
- Initiate a review of the World Trade Organization Agriculture Agreement.

- Take up the issue of intellectual property rights and sustainable development.

- Investigate the impacts of liberalization on sustainable development.

- Urge the special session of the General Assembly to adopt a resolution urging States and organizations to implement activities proposed during the fourth session of the Intergovernmental Panel on Forests.

- Establish a subcommission on corporate accountability.

G. Summary report of the dialogue session with farmers

(16 April 1997)

Chairman: Ms. Monika Linn-Locher (Switzerland), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitator: Ms. Linda Elswick, World Sustainable Agriculture Association, United States of America

Presenters: Farmers representing the following organizations made presentations: Federation of Swedish Farmers; Danish Farmers' Union; National Farmers' Union, Canada; Zambian Women in Agriculture; Union Nacional de Agricultores y Ganaderos, Nicaragua; New Brunswick Federation of Agriculture, Canada; Centre for Citizens Initiative - Moscow, Russian Federation; and Karnataka State Farmers Association, India.

PRESENTATIONS

The Earth Summit had heightened awareness of important links among farming, environment and development. Farmers have a greater awareness of their environmental responsibilities to society, are increasingly addressing environmental impacts of their practices as well as identifying and carrying out solutions. Issues concerning food and agriculture transformed the abstract concept of sustainable development into something tangible and meaningful to all people. Farm management and resource conservation, technological developments, land tenure, trade, and the role of women were just a few of the many issues that surfaced in the discussion between farmers and Governments.

Activities

Farmers are undertaking initiatives to promote sustainable agriculture. Some of these activities are indicated below.

- A voluntary farm programme in Denmark engaged participants at national and local levels, and allowed farmers to view themselves as an integrated part of society. That programme educated farmers and promoted good farming practices. The programme also established standards for pesticide and fertilizer use, animal manure, water quality, energy consumption and research. It was carried out through a combination of farmer participation in the regulatory process and support of consumers.

- Various other programmes such as environmental farm plans based on self-evaluation, eco-audits and codes of good farm practice have been initiated (Canada, Sweden).

- Zambian women have organized a programme for women farmers that has empowered women and educated them about sustainable farming practices and management.

- With the help of an American non-governmental organization, a group in the Russian Federation developed a consultative process for farmers, with a particular focus on women farmers. That programme educated both producers and consumers about sustainable agriculture.

- Land tenure reforms, agricultural cooperatives, rural banks and rural women's services have helped in creating a supportive economic and social framework for sustainable agriculture in several countries.

Obstacles

Obstacles faced by farmers concern poverty and low farm income, lack of land tenure, trade policies and attitudes towards biological diversity. Examples are given below.

- Farmers, historically, have been viewed as people who exploit the land.

- Insecure land tenure and poverty, government neglect and lack of investment in rural areas undermine sustainable farming efforts, especially in developing countries.

- Low net farm incomes force farmers to consider only the short-term and not to take into account the long-term effects of their activities on the environment. Furthermore, such low prospects do not attract young people into farming, which is leading to an ageing farming population (in industrialized countries) or the feminization of agriculture (in developing countries).

- Policies that favour cash crop production can lead to unsustainable agriculture.

- The World Trade Organization and trade liberalization have created a watershed of adverse effects on farmers. The global market is determining what is produced, who is producing it and who has control over what is produced. Globalization of the economy has also usurped the place of instruments for ensuring food security, and moved decision-making outside of public institutions.

- For some countries, barriers to export, especially escalating tariffs on processed and semi-processed agricultural products, have detrimental effects on their agricultural activities and deny them the opportunity to develop domestic agro-industrial processing.

- Farmers find it difficult to participate in the international arena for a variety of reasons, including financial constraints.
- Vested interests in industrialized countries refuse to recognize peasants and indigenous peoples as generators, owners and guardians of biodiversity.
- The spread of urban and industrial areas threatens prime agricultural land.
- Organic farming receives little attention and recognition from government.

Priorities

- Priorities outlined by farmers address environmentally sound farming techniques, land tenure, partnerships and trade. Examples are set forth below.
- Identifying problems using local knowledge and seeking local solutions and long-term land tenure are imperative for sustainable agriculture.
- Agriculture is a long-term business. Farmers, therefore, need a long-term, predictable perspective and policy environment in which to work.
- Farmers cannot pursue sustainable agriculture alone. Close cooperation between farmers and authorities is essential in establishing a legislative framework in such areas as the use of manure, fertilizer and pesticides, animal intensity, and protected natural areas.
- Research is important for furthering the use of agricultural practices. Consequently, farmers should enhance alliances with scientific and technical institutions.
- Improved dialogue with agro-industry, environmental and conservation groups and with consumer associations is also necessary.
- The effects of trade liberalization on farmers require greater attention.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements during the dialogue session: Australia, Canada, Finland, Germany, Ireland, Japan, Peru, Philippines, United States of America. Farmers and representatives of non-governmental organizations from the floor also took part in the discussion.

One organic farmer called for increased attention to organic farming (International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements (IFOAM)). He pointed out the increased demand for organic farming products in Austria, Switzerland and Denmark. The representative of a non-governmental organization noted that the Commission on the Status of Women supported farmers, especially organic farmers. She pointed to references to organic farming by the Fourth World Conference on Women. These references stress linkages between health and agriculture.

Although changes in production methods could lead to extra costs for farmers, a panellist noted that there are win-win situations where, for example, a reduction in the use of inputs through better management practices leads to a decrease both in costs and in the impact on the environment. Another panellist added that environmentally friendly production methods also make good business sense, since consumers are increasingly demanding that agricultural production take the environment into consideration.

Several speakers emphasized problems associated with the World Trade Organization and trade liberalization. One non-governmental organization representative said that farmer marketing boards, backed by Governments, were essential for family farmers. Yet such boards are currently being challenged by the World Trade Organization (Canadian farmer). Another representative of a non-governmental organization (Bolivia) called for protection of rural farmers against free market forces. One government representative suggested that globalization responded to consumer demands by establishing lower prices. As an example, he pointed to decreased prices after his Government had joined the European Union (Finland). A farmer pointed out that not all farmers were benefiting from the so-called free trade (farmer from Nicaragua). Even when they wish to export their products, there are still trade barriers and the dumping of subsidized products continues to threaten the livelihoods of domestic products.

One participant noted that the Commission on Sustainable Development in its documentation had failed to mention the Leipzig International Technical Conference on Plant Genetic Resources, efforts of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), and initiatives under the Convention on Biological Diversity relevant to agriculture (India). She and others emphasized links between biodiversity and agriculture, biosafety issues and the threat of technological totalitarianism.

One government representative asked how farmers reconciled their roles as business people and guardians of the earth, especially in the third world. He asked about the possibility of having these two roles coincide, especially in the third world (Germany). A panellist responded that legislation was required to help mesh the farmer's different roles. A farmer representing a third world Government called attention to the fact that environmental subsidies in one country can impact on another country's agricultural sector annihilating peasant households and small-scale agriculture. One government representative considered that the trade rules needed to be rewritten to encourage sustainable agriculture (India).

One government representative asked whether the world's farmers would be capable of feeding the increasing world population. In response, farmers noted the role of technology and local agriculture. One non-governmental organization representative pointed out that the question was one concerning not the quantity of food, but rather its distribution.

One government representative recognized the negative public image of farmers in some countries. He asked whether farmer/consumer group partnerships would be productive (Ireland). A panellist suggested that what consumers said and what they bought were two different matters. Farmers will produce what consumers want. In some cases, they have to be prepared to pay higher prices for food products.

One representative noted that many people in rural communities were landless but contributed to food production as farm workers. He urged Governments to address hunger and undernourishment and stressed that each household unit must be able to meet daily food requirements (Philippines).

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Some challenges and recommendations are presented below.

- The international community should take a more comprehensive approach to food security by involving representatives from all sectors of society.
- Farmers' organizations should be included in national delegations attending meetings that discuss issues related to the agricultural sector.
- Increased interaction between the United Nations and the World Trade Organization is needed.
- The Commission on Sustainable Development should facilitate approval of the Global Plan of Action and the International Undertaking on Plant Genetic Resources as a protocol to the Convention on Biological Diversity. This requires immediate finalization of the revision to the International Undertaking as a protocol to the Convention on Biological Diversity.
- There is a need to review, assess and, if necessary, modify existing national legislation and international agreements concerning intellectual property rights, land tenure and seed legislation (also post-World Trade Organization legislation) to ensure that they support and do not run counter to farmers' rights and to the overarching objectives of the Convention on Biological Diversity.
- The WTO review process in 1999-2000 should lead to removal of agriculture from the Uruguay Round of multilateral trade negotiations agreements and to the elimination of trade-related intellectual property rights (TRIPs) in agriculture.
- There should be a moratorium on bioprospecting activities, as well as on the release of genetically modified plant varieties and organisms.
- Developed countries and agribusinesses should provide compensation for the developing-country knowledge and resources that they have been using for many years.

- The Commission on Sustainable Development should promote the establishment of a permanent working group on farmers' rights, biodiversity and sustainable agriculture.

- An international convention to address farmer's rights and sustainable agriculture issues would help to build accountability within the structure of international law.

- The Commission on Sustainable Development should arrange for consultative status for farmers as a major group by the time of the special session of the General Assembly.

- Farmers' organizations, especially those from the developing countries and in countries in transition, should be supported and strengthened to become effective partners in policy design and implementation.

- Public research on sustainable farming practices, improved cropping methods and extension services should be increased at all levels.

H. Summary report of the dialogue session with local authorities

(16 April 1997)

Chairman: Ambassador Bagher Asadi, (Islamic Republic of Iran), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitators: Mr. Jean Pierre Elong Mbassi, World Assembly of Cities and Local Authorities Coordination (WACLAC)

Mr. Jeb Brugman, International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives (ICLEI)

Presenters: Representatives and mayors of the following organizations and/or municipalities made presentations: World Assembly of Cities and Local Authorities Coordination (WACLAC); Dubai Municipality; Policy Committee, Corporation of London, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland; City of Marrakech, Morocco; Barcelona, Spain; Cajamarca Municipality/Association of Peruvian Municipalities; Leicester City Council, United Kingdom; and International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives (ICLEI).

PRESENTATIONS

Since the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development held at Rio de Janeiro, local authorities have been actively implementing their responsibilities as identified in Agenda 21. More than 1,800 local authorities from 64 countries have established Local Agenda 21 processes. They are working to reorganize themselves and change mindsets and practices in order to become more effective agents of sustainable development. They are establishing new mechanisms for international cooperation with each other and the United Nations system, as attested, for example, by the establishment of WACLAC. In their 1995 meeting with the Commission on Sustainable Development, local authorities called for greater recognition of their key role in sustainable development. In contrast, they are now focusing on the key issues and obstacles with respect to implementing Agenda 21 at the local level.

Activities

Local authorities from around the world spoke about Local Agenda 21 initiatives in their communities. These efforts are described below.

- Local authorities have been heavily involved with the United Nations Centre for Human Settlements (Habitat) in follow-up to the United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II).

- The United Arab Emirates have developed a best practices competition to encourage sustainable development activities.

- The City of London has undertaken a number of Local Agenda 21 initiatives. A focal point of its efforts involves steering groups and task forces comprising a wide range of stakeholders. These groups have developed and launched plans on a number of Agenda 21 issues including energy, health and the natural environment. The City of London has also established a green belt to ensure open spaces; created the first smoke control zone; increased use of public transport; launched an environmental forum on environmental risk management; and undertaken a major regeneration study. Other London-based programmes are providing support to local authorities in Africa and examining sustainability indicators.

- Development of a sanitation programme in Marrakech involved national/local government cooperation, a tax financing programme, citizen participation and privatization. Other Marrakech projects are providing housing to low-income people and restoring historic sites in Marrakech.

- Barcelona is working to implement Agenda 21 via a consensus-building forum. Components of the Barcelona process include decentralization and citizen participation.

- Leicester City Council reported on a national campaign for Local Agenda 21. This campaign provides training, guidance, research and technical support to local authorities and communities for Local Agenda 21 planning and implementation. The campaign has recruited 75 per cent of local authorities to establish a multisectoral forum to oversee planning of Local Agenda 21 implementation. The campaign has also resulted in a survey, which indicates considerable progress concerning awareness and implementation of Agenda 21 throughout the United Kingdom.

- In countries such as the United Kingdom and Sweden, national campaigns are proving instrumental in implementing Local Agenda 21 initiatives.

Obstacles

Local authorities highlighted the obstacles they face in implementing Local Agenda 21. These obstacles include lack of political will; insufficient resources; absence of partnerships; and policies that promote unsustainable practices. Specific difficulties include those described below.

- Partnerships between national and local governments are often underdeveloped.

- In some cases, national Governments and their policies pose the most important barriers to Local Agenda 21 implementation. These obstacles include lack of interest in and attention to Agenda 21; absence of integrated transportation policies; unsustainable energy policies; lack of tax raising powers; and poor enforcement of environmental laws.

- Subsidies that encourage unsustainable practices also pose problems in many countries.

- Banking institutions often overlook the social value of agriculture programmes which are in urgent need of financial assistance.

Priorities

The priorities outlined by local authorities reflect the obstacles they wish to overcome. Suggestions by local authorities include calls for enhanced local/national partnerships; capacity-building; attention to Agenda 21 and Habitat II objectives; and information networks. More detailed priorities are listed below.

- Develop and enhance partnerships between local and subnational governments, as well as national Governments, to create incentives and overcome disincentives to sustainable practices at the local level.

- Support development of political will to address sustainability issues.

- Build capacities of local authorities particularly in the area of finance, and provide powers equal to responsibilities.

- Legalize and formalize the relationship between the United Nations and international organizations of local authorities.

- Encourage local governments to be proactive through development of strategic plans.

- Increase harmonization of fiscal policy, and the internalization of social and environmental costs.

- Integrate the provisions of Habitat II and Agenda 21.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements during the dialogue session: Australia, China, Netherlands, France, Peru, Philippines, Sweden, United States of America. Statements were also made by the representative of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and by the representative of a non-governmental organization (Brazil).

Several government representatives emphasized the importance of the dialogue with local authorities and acknowledged that the challenge for sustainability ultimately lay within the world's cities (United States, Netherlands).

One government representative noted that local authorities should aim to assist the United Nations rather than seek assistance from it (France). A panellist responded that local authorities should work to ensure that WACLAC became a permanent body, formally recognized by the United Nations. Another panellist noted that local authorities should have a louder voice in the international community in order to ensure balanced partnerships.

Several government representatives discussed Local Agenda 21 initiatives in their countries. One representative described projects concerning lake management, health and strategic development plans (Philippines). Another representative mentioned sustainable development pilot projects in his country (China). Grass-roots groups, non-governmental organizations and other major group representatives have been especially important in sustainable development efforts (Sweden). Australia will be hosting an international conference entitled "Pathways to Sustainability" in Newcastle (1-5 June 1997). That conference will showcase case studies of local initiatives and make a contribution to the special session of the General Assembly (Australia).

One panellist called for a network that would enable local authorities to share experiences and information. One non-governmental organization representative noted the need to coordinate programmes such as the Global Environment Facility (GEF) and Capacity 21 with Local Agenda 21 initiatives.

One government representative commented that local authority proposals did not pay adequate attention to public participation in Local Agenda 21 implementation processes and stressed the importance of engaging private sector representatives early in the process of Local Agenda 21 implementation (United States). Panellists acknowledged that many groups were involved including educators, non-governmental organizations and the private sector and that participation was the foundation of the Local Agenda 21 process. Particular assistance is required to achieve greater private sector participation in Local Agenda 21 activities.

/...

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Challenges and recommendations for the Commission on Sustainable Development are aimed at strengthening partnerships among local, subnational and national levels, examining obstacles and promoting decentralization. Local authorities highlighted the following challenges and recommendations.

- National campaigns: Local Agenda 21 programmes should be actively encouraged in each country, particularly through establishment of Local Agenda 21 national campaigns in partnership with local authority associations.
- Global targets and overcoming obstacles: The Commission on Sustainable Development should establish global targets to encourage Local Agenda 21 campaigns, and to review and address obstacles to Local Agenda 21 initiatives.
- Fresh water: The international community should provide an enabling environment that encourages subnational and local authorities (with investments from public and private sources) to extend and increase efficiency of water supply and sanitation services, especially in fast-growing urban areas and poor rural communities.
- Decentralization: Trends towards decentralization of government to local levels should be recognized and support should be given to local authorities to assist in implementation of their new governance and service provision responsibilities.
- Study of national barriers to Local Agenda 21 implementation: Other proposals requested the Commission on Sustainable Development to commission a study that examined barriers (especially those erected and maintained by national Governments) to Local Agenda 21 implementation. Barriers may concern transportation, energy, tax policies, subsidies and poor enforcement of regulations.

I. Summary report of the dialogue session with business and industry

(18 April 1997)

Chairman: Ambassador John Ashe (Antigua and Barbuda), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

Facilitators: Mrs. Maria Cattaui, International Chamber of Commerce, and Mr. Bjorn Stigson, World Business Council for Sustainable Development

Presenters: Representatives of the following organizations and corporations made presentations: Xerox Corporation; ICI; EnviroServe;

Scudder, Stevens and Clark; Tokyo Electric Power Company; British Petroleum Company; Aracruz Celulose; International Chamber of Commerce; World Business Council for Sustainable Development (WBCSD); Dow Chemical; Grupo IMSA.

PRESENTATIONS

Business has made progress towards sustainable development (examples were presented from the following reports: "Signals of Change" by WBCSD and "Implementation of the ICC Business Charter for Sustainable Development" by ICC). In the late 1970s and early 1980s, companies focused on pollution cleanup and end-of-pipe measures. Today, many of the world's leading companies have adopted more integrated efforts. These involve a systems approach to environmental management, partnerships with government and stakeholders and corporate responsibility throughout the product life-cycle. However, business and industry are still in the early stages of their "green" revolution, and they have yet to engage many small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs), especially those in developing countries.

Activities

The business community has initiated several projects and programmes to promote sustainable development. Some examples of these "signals of change" were presented by the panel, including:

- The International Chamber of Commerce (ICC) developed and launched the Business Charter for Sustainable Development shortly before the Rio Conference. Since then, over 2,500 companies worldwide have adopted the 16 principles of the Business Charter and continue to improve their environmental policy and practice.

- ICC has promoted eco-labelling, waste management, biodiversity and climate-change-related policies. ICC has also developed an environmental management kit for companies.

- Xerox Corporation has implemented eco-efficiency and environmental leadership programmes. Through partnerships with government and stakeholders, Xerox Corporation aims at achieving waste elimination, product stewardship, safe products, zero employee injuries and worldwide compliance with regulations. Specific efforts include programmes for print and toner cartridge return and waste-free factories.

- ICI has instituted a comprehensive Safety, Health and Environmental Management System. This System utilizes tools to promote sustainable practices. These include standards, guidelines, local procedures, auditing, letters of assurance, and performance and policy reviews.

- Many companies are implementing systems for independent verification and performance reviews. The Eco-Management and Audit Scheme (EMAS) is an example of such a programme.

/...

- The chemical industry has implemented a "Responsible Care" programme that involves environmental and social reporting, business charters and principles, and environmental management systems standards.

- Thirty-six industries and 137 business associations in Japan have developed Industry-oriented Environmental Action Plans.

- Scudder, Stevens and Clark serves as an investment manager for the Storebrand, Scudder Environmental Value Fund. The two objectives of this fund are (i) to provide competitive returns against the Morgan Stanley World Index and (ii) to demonstrate that superior investment returns can be earned by use of environmental analytical disciplines. Companies included in the portfolio are judged against a series of environmental criteria.

- BP has developed a clear statement of safety, health, environmental and long-term goals. Targets and management processes are in place to facilitate the realization of goals.

- Aracruz Celulose commissioned the International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED) to conduct a study on the paper cycle. The study covers all aspects of the sustainable paper cycle and makes conclusions regarding related government regulations, eco-labelling and incineration.

- EnviroServe highlighted the importance of SMEs in the economic development of countries such as South Africa while pinpointing the difficulties faced in improving their environmental performance.

Obstacles

Business and industry face several obstacles to furthering sustainable development. These obstacles include difficulties in engaging SMEs and policies that promote unsustainable practices. More specific problems are outlined below:

- Although many leading companies have adopted sustainable development principles, many SMEs lack the resources necessary to follow suit.

- Taxes and subsidies often promote unsustainable behaviour.

- Unnecessary regulations can hinder the efforts of businesses to promote sustainable development.

- Some Governments and cultures discourage stakeholder and outreach initiatives on the part of industry.

- Economic, social and legal frameworks often run counter to sustainability.

Priorities

The business community identified several priority areas. These include:

- Sustainability requires a long-term view.
- Mutual trust among all stakeholders is essential for sustainable development. This requires transparency and commitments involving principles, report and review, and verification.
- Sustainable development requires cooperation involving all sectors.
- All business and industry, not just large multinationals, must adopt sustainable development principles.
- Government must provide the necessary framework for businesses to meet the needs of society and protect the environment. In particular, Governments should provide incentives for sustainability and remove disincentives.
- The developing countries should avoid the past mistakes of the industrialized countries.
- Business practices should involve eco-efficiency, life-cycle management, appropriate consumer information, environmental accounting and environmental benchmarks.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments participated in the discussion: Belgium, China, France, Marshall Islands, Netherlands, Norway, Peru, Republic of Korea, South Africa, Sweden, United States of America.

Other dialogue participants included representatives of the Central and Eastern European Network, Friends of the Earth International, Tools for Transition and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP).

One representative asked about instances of efforts by companies to forestall action on climate change. In particular, he suggested that in acting to protect their short-term profits, the companies were challenging scientific findings regarding global warming. A panelist responded that many business community members want to be involved in the climate change debate and favoured long-term, global solutions. Another panelist recognized the need to change lifestyles, de-couple energy and economic development and adopt alternative energy sources.

One representative noted the difficulty in reconciling industry's preference for voluntary initiatives with the need to have consistency in government policies and environmental standards. He also acknowledged the importance of enabling small and medium-sized businesses (especially those in developing countries) to meet international standards (Belgium). A panelist suggested that big businesses should assist small businesses in adhering to internationally harmonized standards rather than negotiating lower standards for developing countries.

Other comments by government representatives called attention to local participation (United States) and consumer awareness (Peru). One government representative noted that businesses can play an important role in raising environmental consciousness among consumers (Peru). In response, the representative of Xerox Corporation described a communication programme in his company that provided information to salespeople and consumers.

One government representative noted that SME practices were often very harmful to the environment (China). A panelist responded that big businesses needed to support SMEs in their efforts to promote sustainable development.

A non-governmental organization pointed out that environmental degradation resulting from increased volume of production was negating gains in efficiency (Friends of the Earth International). A panelist responded that development, as well as sustainability was necessary and that economic growth meant increased volume of production.

Other government representatives addressed a wide range of topics in their statements. One representative suggested that WBCSD could assist in developing eco-efficiency targets (Netherlands). Another representative noted the complexity of the issues at hand and called for different transparent forums and organizational structures to address those challenges globally and across different scales (South Africa). Another representative raised the issue of technology transfer; he acknowledged the trend towards business-to-business transfer as well as the role that Governments played in providing incentives for such activities (France). A panelist responded by noting the increased flow of technology to developing countries. Another representative suggested that lease-based programmes were often more environmentally sound than other sales approaches.

CHALLENGES AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COMMISSION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The Commission on Sustainable Development should give close attention to all three aspects of sustainable development - economic growth, social development and environmental protection. It should base its agenda on sound science and careful assessment of risks and economic costs. It should focus in its next phase of work on those issues for which no clear focal point for policy discussion and recommendations has been established in the United Nations system. The business world welcomes a continued systematic dialogue involving major groups, but it is essential that Governments participate actively in this process. Governments should promote sustainable development by:

- Capitalizing on the ability of business and industry to change and adapt quickly.

- Allowing business to chose between a minimum regulatory system or one that permits flexibility of approach in return for higher performance targets.

- Helping to motivate and introduce voluntary systems that encourage responsibility for products throughout their life cycles.

- Examining whether taxes and subsidies promote unsustainable behaviour and changing policies accordingly.

- Moving from income- to consumption-based taxes over a sufficiently long period of time.

- Gradually getting prices right so that products reflect their full environmental costs.

- Re-examining the conventional measure of gross domestic product (GDP) and considering supplementing it with a net-GDP measure that reflects resource depletion.

- Promoting stakeholder outreach and involvement regarding the business role in promoting sustainable development.

J. Summary report of the synthesis session

(18 April 1997)

Chairman: Ambassador Bagher Asadi (Islamic Republic of Iran), Vice-Chairman, Commission on Sustainable Development

During the final dialogue session, representatives of the following organizations provided a brief recap of the views expressed during their dialogue session and made recommendations for future dialogue sessions:

International Council of Scientific Unions (ICSU) (for scientific and technological communities)

Youth Caucus (for children and youth)

Women's Environment and Development Organization (WEDO) (for women)

Maori Congress (for indigenous people)

International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (ICFTU) (for workers and trade unions)

Instituo del Tercer Mundo (for non-governmental organizations)

International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives (ICLEI) (for local authorities)

International Federation of Agricultural Producers (IFAP) (for farmers)

International Chamber of Commerce (ICC) and World Business Council for Sustainable Development (WBCSD) (for business and industry)

All presenters felt that the dialogue sessions were useful as a first step towards further sharing of views on problems and solutions as well as building of greater consensus around Agenda 21 objectives. Several presenters expressed disappointment with the low attendance of Governments in the dialogue sessions.

A performance by the New York City Labor Choir preceded the question/ dialogue segment of the programme.

DIALOGUE

Representatives of the following Governments made statements: Canada, Finland, France, Peru, Sweden, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America. Statements were also made by representatives of the following bodies: South Pacific Forum Secretariat, United Nations Association-United States of America (UNA-USA), International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements (IFOAM), ICFTU, NGO Steering Committee of the Commission on Sustainable Development and Human Rights and Peace Caucus.

The statements expressed appreciation for the dialogue sessions, particularly in terms of showing the progress made through major groups' activities during the first five years of Agenda 21 implementation. Low attendance was attributed to the numerous meetings and events rather than to lack of interest in sharing views with major groups (Sweden). Major group panellists were asked about the extent to which they engaged in dialogue with each other (Finland) and about which methods they utilized to mobilize their constituencies to act upon Agenda 21 objectives (France). It was suggested that universities should be more involved in exchanging information (Peru). The South Pacific Forum announced that it would distribute the dialogue session summaries among its member States.

The crucial role of young people in furthering the goals of Agenda 21 was emphasized (UNA-USA). Local Agenda 21 initiatives were pointed to as a vehicle for mobilizing local Governments and communities at the local level (ICLEI). It was pointed out that the Commission on Sustainable Development was a perfect global forum in which to explore solutions as the next phase moved increasingly towards more action and implementation (WBCSD). The fact was also highlighted that achieving sustainable development was a slow process in which continued dialogue with major groups was crucial (NGO Steering Committee of the Commission on Sustainable Development). It was suggested that in future the Commission on Sustainable Development reporting process should involve major groups to a greater extent, as well as focus on the human rights and military aspects of sustainable development (Human Rights and Peace Caucus). The trade union representative called attention to the ongoing silence about workplace issues in Agenda 21 follow-up (ICFTU).

/...

Suggestions and proposals for future dialogue sessions

All participants made suggestions for future dialogue sessions or similar vehicles with respect to exchange of views between Governments and major groups. The following proposals were put forth:

- Focus dialogue sessions on specific thematic issues (Canada, Sweden, United Kingdom, ICSU, Instituto del Tercer Mundo, Maori Congress). Possible themes mentioned parallelled the key issues singled out in the high-level segment of the current session of the Commission on Sustainable Development.
- Encourage a more interactive format (Canada).
- Schedule dialogue sessions outside the negotiating hours (Sweden) or when more delegations are available to attend them (United States).
- Involve other sectors of society such as those comprising artists, writers, religious communities (Sweden).
- Continue hearing the views of all major groups (United States).
- Ensure more participation from the South (Sweden).
- Enable dialogue between the major groups in a systematic way for the purpose of finding balanced approaches to the costs, benefits and risks involved in sustainable development (WBCSD).
- Establish dialogue sessions as a tradition of the Commission on Sustainable Development and encourage use of this mechanism by other bodies of the United Nations system (NGO Steering Committee of the Commission on Sustainable Development).
